REVIEW ARTICLE

Manipulation of Rubisco: the amount, activity, function and regulation

M. A. J. Parry¹, P. J. Andralojc, R. A. C. Mitchell, P. J. Madgwick and A. J. Keys

Crop Performance and Improvement, Rothamsted Research, Harpenden, Hertfordshire AL5 2JQ, UK

Received 15 November 2002; Accepted 22 January 2003

Abstract

Genetic modification to increase the specificity of Rubisco for CO2 relative to O2 and to increase the catalytic rate of Rubisco in crop plants would have great agronomic importance. The availability of three-dimensional structures of Rubisco at atomic resolution and the characterization of site-directed mutants have greatly enhanced the understanding of the catalytic mechanism of Rubisco. Considerable progress has been made in identifying natural variation in the catalytic properties of Rubisco from different species and in developing the tools for introducing both novel and foreign Rubisco genes into plants. The additional complexities of assembling copies of the two distinct polypeptide subunits of Rubisco into a functional holoenzyme in vivo (requiring sufficient expression, post-translational modification, interaction with chaperonins, and interaction with Rubisco activase) remain a major challenge. The consequences of changing the amount of Rubisco present in leaves have been investigated by the use of antisense constructs. The manipulation of genes encoding Rubisco activase has provided a means to investigate the regulation of Rubisco activity.

Key words: Photosynthesis, *rbc*L *rbc*S, Rubisco, specificity factor, transgenic.

Introduction

Rubisco is the key enzyme responsible for photosynthetic carbon assimilation in catalysing the reaction of CO₂ with ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate (RuBP) to form two molecules of D-phosphoglyceric acid (PGA). It also initiates photorespiration by catalysing the reaction of oxygen, also with

RuBP, to form one molecule each of phosphoglycolate and PGA. It is a complex enzyme and catalyses these reactions at rather slow rates. It constitutes some 30% of the total protein in many leaves for which reason it is of considerable interest in relation to the nitrogen nutrition of plants. Biochemists have shown much interest because of the catalytic mechanism, lack of specificity, regulation, and turnover aspects. Physiologists have been concerned because of the consequences of the properties of Rubisco for the gas exchange characteristics of photosynthetic tissues and because of the consequences of the amount of nitrogen tied up in the enzyme and its recycling upon senescence of leaves.

The significance of the inhibition of photosynthesis in many organisms by oxygen (Warburg, 1920; Ogren, 1984) became evident with the discovery of the oxygenation of RuBP and consequent stimulation of photorespiration (Bowes et al., 1971; Ogren and Bowes, 1971; Lorimer, 1981). Increased CO₂ concentration diminished the inhibitory effect of oxygen on photosynthesis and this also finds explanation in the properties of Rubisco as a catalyst; the carboxylation and oxygenation reactions are catalysed at the same active site on the enzyme and CO₂ and O₂ are competitive substrates (Andrews and Lorimer, 1978). Evolution in various environments, usually hot or deficient in available inorganic carbon (CO₂, HCO₃, CO_3^{2-}), has resulted in photosynthetic organisms that can concentrate CO₂ in cells or organelles containing their Rubisco. Terrestrial plants with a CO₂ concentrating mechanism, C₄ plants, have much higher rates of photosynthesis in warm conditions at high light intensities than C₃ plants that have no CO₂ concentrating mechanism (Hatch, 1976; Edwards and Walker, 1983) Also, C₃ plants in atmospheres with low O2, or elevated CO2, assimilate CO₂ and grow more quickly than in ambient conditions, provided that nutrients and temperature are not limiting. Mechanistic models (Farquhar et al., 1980; Collatz et al.,

¹ To whom correspondence should be addressed. Fax: +44 (0)1582 763010. E-mail: martin.parry@bbsrc.ac.uk

1322 Parry et al.

1990) of photosynthetic gas exchange based upon Rubisco kinetics have proved very successful in representing the effects of light, temperature and atmospheric composition on assimilation of carbon by plants.

Genetic manipulation of Rubisco to double its specificity for CO_2 would theoretically increase $A_{(max)}$ by perhaps 20%, and photosynthesis at sub-saturating light intensities would also be improved (Reynolds *et al.*, 2000). Consequently, it has been accepted by many that manipulating Rubisco to decrease the inhibitory effect of oxygen and its competitive involvement in reaction with RuBP, as opposed to reaction with CO_2 , is a worthwhile target to increase the productivity of plants.

Essential to the activity of Rubisco is the carbamylation of an active site lysine residue (Lorimer and Miziorko, 1980). The extent of this carbamylation depends on the concentrations of CO₂ and Mg²⁺, the absence from the non-carbamylated sites of certain phosphorylated compounds and particularly RuBP, and the activity of an enzyme called Rubisco activase (Portis, 1992). The activity of this latter enzyme is controlled by the ratio of ATP/ADP (Streusand and Portis, 1987) and redox potential, in effect by light intensity (Zhang et al., 2002). Rubisco activase also facilitates the removal of 2-carboxyarabinitol 1-phosphate (CA1P) from carbamylated sites of Rubisco (Robinson and Portis, 1988). CA1P is a tight binding naturally occurring inhibitor of Rubisco which is present bound to the enzyme in many species at night. The significance of the presence of CA1P is subject to some debate. It could be a regulator of activity at low light intensities, but may be more important in protecting Rubisco from degradation by proteases (Khan et al., 1999) when the natural substrate, RuBP, is present at low concentrations. Manipulation of the activity of Rubisco activase or of the synthesis and breakdown of CA1P may be of value. These aspects are explored. The large amounts of Rubisco in leaves has had consequences for the development of research on this enzyme (Kung, 1976; Ellis, 1979). There is so much present that not only can it sometimes be seen as crystals in the chloroplast stroma (Steer et al., 1966) but it also crystallizes very readily from relatively crude extracts (Chan et al., 1972). It has been estimated to be normally present at a concentration of 240 mg ml⁻¹ in the stroma of chloroplasts (Wildner, 1981) and constitutes some 30-50% (Kung, 1976; Ellis, 1979) of the soluble protein in the leaves of C₃ plants and a very high percentage of the total protein in leaves. Nevertheless, particularly in bright light it may exert considerable limitation over the rate of CO₂ fixation (Hudson et al., 1992). The fate of Rubisco during leaf senescence has been intensively studied and the nitrogen from this source has been shown to be extensively reutilized in the synthesis of proteins in seeds and perennating organs (Dalling et al., 1976; Peoples et al., 1983; Millard and Catt, 1988). Thus

the function of Rubisco as a store of nitrogen has resulted in much speculation and research.

The genes for the Rubisco polypeptide subunits from many species have been cloned and sequenced, as have genes for Rubisco activase polypeptides. Furthermore, the crystal structure of Rubisco from several species and the extensive homology of amino acid sequences has allowed the advance of genetic manipulation, protein engineering and transformation experiments (Spreitzer and Salvucci, 2002). One problem with the manipulation of Rubisco in higher plants is that it is composed of eight large and eight small polypeptide subunits and that the genes for the small subunit are in the nuclear genome (Kawashima and Wildman, 1972), but those for the large subunit are encoded in the chloroplast genome (Chan and Wildman, 1972; Ellis, 1981). Problems have also been encountered in assembling large and small subunits into the hexadecameric holoenzyme following manipulation (Gutteridge and Gatenby, 1995). Many protein engineering projects have, therefore, been conducted using cyanobacterial, algal and bacterial Rubiscos for which assembly into the holoenzyme is less problematic. Mutagenesis in vitro has been used to make changes to DNA encoding both large and small subunits. The effects of such changes on the expressed protein have been used to increase understanding of the catalytic properties of Rubisco and the extent to which the specificity and activity can be altered. The use of antisense constructs to alter the amount of expression of Rubisco has been used both to determine whether the amount of Rubisco in plants can be decreased to save nutrient nitrogen and to determine the extent to which Rubisco controls the rate of photosynthesis. Transgenic plants expressing altered amounts of Rubisco activase or Rubisco activase polypeptides with mutations or from different species have also increased the understanding of the details of Rubisco activation. This review aims to examine the information obtained by all these forms of manipulation as well as the prospects, and appropriate objectives, for future experiments.

Manipulating specificity factor

Directed mutagenesis

One approach to crop improvement is the identification of amino acid residues that confer key catalytic properties, such as the specificity factor (τ , expressed as the ratio of $V_c K_o / V_o K_c$) that is an important diagnostic parameter widely used as an indication of overall efficiency. Such studies have been facilitated by the availability of high resolution 3-D structures for Rubisco from both microorganisms (e.g. *Rhodspirillum rubrum*, Schneider *et al.*, 1986; chlamydomonas (*Chlamydomonas rheinhardtii*), Taylor *et al.*, 2001; *Galderia patita*, Sugawara *et al.*, 1999; cyanobacteria, Newman and Gutteridge, 1993) and

higher plants (spinach (Spinacea oleracea), Andersson et al., 1989; Andersson, 1996; tobacco (Nicotiana tabacum) Chapman et al., 1988). The initial studies of Rubisco structure/function used *R. rubrum* Rubisco genes since they could be expressed in E. coli to generate active Rubisco (Somerville and Somerville, 1984; Gutteridge et al., 1984). This enabled potential substitutions to be evaluated in vitro, but it is difficult to relate engineered changes in structure of the homodimeric R. rubrum enzyme (together with the resulting subtle changes in kinetic characteristics) to Rubiscos with the more complex hexadecameric structure found in crop Unfortunately, the expression in E. coli of genes for the hexadecameric Rubisco from crop plants (e.g. wheat (Triticum aestivum) and maize (Zea mays) (Gatenby et al., 1981; Bradley et al., 1986)) did not yield active enzyme. This is probably attributable to mismatches between the higher plant Rubisco and the host chaperone system involved in the assembly of holoenzyme (Gutteridge and Gatenby, 1995). Despite these limitations, considerable insight into the structure/function relationships of hexadecameric forms of Rubisco have been gleaned, either from prokarvotes such as cvanobacteria that can be expressed and assembled into an active holoenzyme in E. coli (Gatenby et al., 1985; Gatenby and Ellis, 1990) or following chloroplast transformation and classical genetics with the green alga chalmydomonas (Spreitzer, 1993, 1999). The Rubisco from these sources has over 80% amino acid and nucleotide homology with Rubiscos in crop plants.

One major objective for Rubisco manipulation has been to alter the discrimination between CO₂ and O₂ (i.e. to alter the specificity factor, τ). Altering specificity is a difficult goal since neither gas binds directly to the active site: the formation of the enediol of RuBP, with which CO₂ or O₂ react directly, is common to both the caboxylation and oxygenation reactions. Several residues have been shown to influence specificity, but, in many cases, the effect must be indirect since many of these are not close enough to interact directly with the substrate or reaction intermediates.

Many attempts to manipulate the specificity factor have focused on the C-terminal loop 6 region of the large subunit. Chen and Spreitzer (1989) working with chlamydomonas provided the first clue that this region was important to specificity for the gaseous substrates. Mutation of valine 331 of the large subunit to alanine decreased the specificity factor by almost 40%. Loop 6, at the mouth of the alpha/beta barrel, is an integral part of the catalytic site, the analysis of various 3-D structures suggests that the loop is flexible in the initial stages of carboxylation but then, early in catalysis, folds or slides to occlude the active site. This closed conformation of loop 6 is maintained by the residues of the C-terminal tail (Knight et al., 1990) and the N-terminal loops (Newman and

Gutteridge, 1993) of the large subunit. Valine 331 at the N terminal end of loop 6 is the 'spring' responsible for the movement of the loop (Newman and Gutteridge, 1993). Characterization of a loop 6 deletion mutant has demonstrated that loop 6 is vital to normal processing of the enediolate intermediate (Larson et al., 1995). Many of the loop 6 residues are conserved, but only lysine 334 at the apex of the loop has ionic interactions with the transition state analogue 2-carboxyarabinitol 1,5-bisphosphate (CABP). During carboxylation, lysine 334 polarizes both oxygens of CO₂, thereby enhancing the electrophilic status of the carbon atom of CO₂, promoting electrophilic attack by CO₂ on C2 of the enediol to form the 2-carboxy, 3-keto intermediate (Cleland et al., 1998). Although site-directed mutants of lysine 334 catalysed enediolate formation they were unable to catalyse the reaction of the enediolate with CO₂ or form a stable complex with CABP (Soper et al., 1988; Hartman and Lee, 1989; Gutteridge et al., 1993). Thus lysine 334 is thought to play a specific role in stabilizing the transition state intermediates of both the carboxylation and oxygenation reactions, thereby facilitating the reaction between the gaseous substrate and the enediolate.

Within loop 6 there are some differences between the residues found in model systems and crop plants. These residues have been mutated either individually or together in several studies and analysis of the resultant enzymes has confirmed that loop 6 plays a role in determining the specificity factor of Rubisco (Table 1). Changing the chlamydomonas large subunit residue leucine 326 together with methionine 349 for the corresponding higher plant residues, isoleucine 326 and leucine 349, by in vitro mutagenesis and chloroplast transformation caused a 21% decrease in specificity factor (Zhu and Spreitzer, 1996). In tobacco, changing leucine 335 for valine decreased both the specificity and carboxylation rates to 25% of the wildtype values (Whitney et al., 1999). Similarly in cyanobacteria, substitution of leucine 332 with methionine, isoleucine, valine, threonine, or alanine decreased the specificity factor by as much as 67% (Lee et al., 1993). Although replacement of alanine 340 by histidine increased the specificity factor by 13%, this was accompanied by a 33% fall in V_c , replacement of alanine 340 by asparagine increased the specificity factor by 9% and V_c by 19% (Madgwick et al., 1998). The specificity factor of Rubisco from higher plants is greater than that from cyanobacteria. When four consecutive residues from cyanobacterial Rubisco were substituted for the analogous cassette of residues found in higher plants, the specificity was significantly increased (Parry et al., 1992; Kane et al., 1994). However, since these increases were relatively small (5-10%) they could not fully account for the difference in kinetic properties between cyanobacterial and higher plant enzymes. None of the residues in loop 6 interact directly with CABP and so any effect of loop 6

1324 Parry et al.

Table 1. Per cent increase or decrease in relative specificity factor of cyanobacterial, chlamydomonas and tobacco Rubisco in which residues within loop 6 and helix 6 have been substituted by site-directed mutagenesis and yielded assembled active Rubisco

The sequence number preceded by the single-letter representation for the wild-type residue at that position is followed by the single letter representation for the replacement.

Mutation	% Change	Species	Authors	
V 331A	-42	chlamydomonas	Chen et al., 1991	
V331G	-64	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
V331A	-46	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
V331L	-13	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
V331M	-71	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
K334R	-99	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
L335M	-54	cyanobacteria	Lee et al., 1993	
L335I	-67	cyanobacteria	Lee et al., 1993	
L335V	-60	cyanobacteria	Lee et al., 1993	
L335T	-35	cyanobacteria	Lee et al., 1993	
L335A	-55	cyanobacteria	Lee et al., 1993	
L335V	-75	N. tabacum	Whitney et al., 1999	
D338E	+4	cyanobacteria	Parry <i>et al.</i> , 1992	
K339R	0	cyanobacteria	Parry et al., 1992	
K339P	-3	cyanobacteria	Read and Tabita, 1994	
A340L	-8	cyanobacteria	Read and Tabita, 1994	
A340E	-18	cyanobacteria	Parry et al., 1992	
A340H	+13	cyanobacteria	Madgwick et al., 1998	
A340N	+9	cyanobacteria	Madgwick et al., 1998	
A340D	+5	cyanobacteria	Madgwick et al., 1998	
A340G	-6	cyanobacteria	Madgwick et al., 1998	
A340R	+3	cyanobacteria	Madgwick et al., 1998	
A340Y	+12	cyanobacteria	Madgwick et al., 1998	
S341I	-1	cyanobacteria	Parry et al., 1992	
S341M	+8	cyanobacteria	Read and Tabita 1994	
T342I	-36	chlamydomonas	Chen et al., 1991	
T342I	-18	cyanobacteria	Read and Tabita, 1994	
	- 7	·	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
T342L	- 7	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
T342M	-11	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
T342V	-23	cyanobacteria	Read and Tabita, 1994	
DKAS338-341	+7	cyanobacteria	Parry et al., 1992	
EREI		=	-	
DKAS338-341	+3	cyanobacteria	Gutteridge et al., 1993	
ERDI	+5	•	Kane et al., 1994	
L326I and M349L	-21	chlamydomonas	Zhu and Spreitzer, 1996	

mutations on the reactivity of the enediolate intermediate mediated by lysine 334 must have been indirect. Interactions between residues distant from the catalytic site must also be important. In cyanobacteria the ε-amino group of lysine 334 may not be optimally positioned within the active site, since mutation of other residues at the C-terminal end of loop 6 resulted in a 3–13% increase in the specificity factor (Parry *et al.*, 1992; Gutteridge *et al.*, 1993; Madgwick *et al.*, 1998). In these instances, the improved specificity was attributed to repositioning the ε-amino group of lysine 334. Subsequent studies focusing on the adjacent alpha helix (helix 6) confirmed the importance of this region to the specificity factor (Ramage *et al.*, 1998).

Structural studies have revealed that the conformation of loop 6 is maintained by the residues of the C-terminal tail (Knight et al., 1990) and of the N-terminal loop (Newman and Gutteridge, 1993). Portis (1990) demonstrated the importance of the C-terminus of the large subunit to catalytic function. Removal of the C-terminal residues of the spinach or chlamydomonas Rubisco large subunit by carboxypeptidase-A reduced carboxylase activity by 60-70%. Similarly, mutants in which the C-terminus of the large subunit was truncated lost catalytic activity and were no longer able to bind CABP (Gutteridge et al., 1993). Variations in length and charge of the C-terminus were found to have little effect on specificity factor at 35 °C. However, the specificity factor at 10 °C for a mutant with a two amino acid (aspartate-lysine) extension at the C-terminus was at least 10% higher than the wild type Rubisco (Zhu et al., 1998). It was suggested that the extended C-terminus established additional interactions with the protein surface, which altered specificity (Zhu et al., 1998). The eight large subunits of hexadecameric Rubisco occur as four homodimers in the holoenzyme. The side chain of lysine 128 is sandwiched between loop 6 and the C-terminal tail of the other large subunit of the dimeric pair. Examination of the 3-D structure of the large subunits (Bainbridge et al., 1998) reveals that the ε-amino group of lysine 128 is capable of forming hydrogen bonds with the backbone carbonyls of loop 6 (valine 331 and glycine 333) and with C-terminal phenylalanine 467, close to the apex of loop 6. Substitution of lysine 128 loosened the binding of CABP to activated Rubisco (Bainbridge et al., 1998). All substitutions for lysine 128 were detrimental, decreasing both specificity factor and catalytic activity. Disruption of hydrogen bonds between the ε-amino group and backbone carbonyls of loop 6 may cause the \varepsilon-amino group of lysine 334 to assume a different position within the catalytic site, impairing its ability to polarize the two oxygens of CO₂, thereby decreasing its potency as an electrophile. In addition, asparagine 123 on the same loop interacts directly with CABP; mutation of the equivalent residue in R. rubrum to glycine decreased the specificity factor more than 10-fold and drastically decreased K_{cat carboxylation} to 1% of wild type (Chène et al., 1992; Soper et al., 1992). The region around lysine 128 is highly conserved. Changing lysine 128 to arginine, glycine, asparagine, histidine or glutamine did not cause a major disruption to the tertiary structure of the large subunit and so alterations in kinetic parameters are likely to result from disruption in the local environment of residue 128 rather than from gross structural changes.

Although providing valuable information on the relationship between structure and function, engineering cyanobacterial and algal Rubiscos has so far failed to produce an enzyme even 'as good' as those already found in crop plants. Considerable increases in the specificity factor of Rubisco of crop plants could be achieved by

Table 2. *Manipulation of Rubisco in tobacco*The symbol in the protein and activity columns indicate whether (+) or not (-) protein or Rubisco activity were found in those studies.

Introduced rbcL or rbcS	Transformation approach	Protein	Activity	Authors
Tobacco rbcL	Nuclear	+	+	Kanevski and Maliga, 1994
Tobacco rbcS	Chloroplast	+	+	Whitney et al., 2001
Chromatium vinosum rbcL	Nuclear	_	_	Madgwick et al., 2002
Cyanobacteria <i>rbc</i> L	Nuclear	_	_	Madgwick et al., 2002
Cyanobacteria <i>rbc</i> L	Cloroplast	_	_	Kanevski et al., 1999
Galdieria sulphuraria rbcL and rbcS	Chloroplast	+	_	Whitney et al., 2001
Phaeodactylum tricornutum rbcL and rbcS	Chloroplast	+	_	Whitney et al., 2001
Helianthus annuus rbcL	Chloroplast	+	+	Kanevski et al., 1999
R. rubrum rbcM	Chloroplast	+	+	Whitney et al., 2001

exploiting the natural variation in the catalytic properties of Rubisco isolated from different species. The highest reported value for Rubisco specificity factor is 238, found in the red alga Galdieria partita (Uemura et al., 1996) which is almost 3-times greater than that reported for Rubisco from most crop plants (Parry et al., 1989; Read and Tabita, 1994). Introduction of both subunits of a foreign Rubisco may not be necessary as, in some cases, it is possible to assemble subunits from different species to obtain functional holoenzyme. Expression in E. coli of the small subunit gene, rbcS, from two eukaryotic marine organisms, Cylindrotheca sp. N1 and Olisthodiscus luteus, together with the gene encoding the large subunit, rbcL, from cyanobacteria has generated functional holoenzyme (Read and Tabita, 1992). The specificity factor for both hybrid enzymes was increased nearly 60% relative to the cyanobacterial Rubisco. By contrast, although expression in E. coli of rbcS from rice, tobacco or wheat, together with the rbcL from cyanobacteria generated functional holoenzyme (Wang et al., 2001), the specificity factor of some of the hybrid enzymes was much lower than that of cyanobacterial Rubisco (Wang et al., 2001). Evidently, although the small subunits are remote from the active site. they can nevertheless still affect key kinetic characteristics like the specificity factor. Whilst these results confirm that hybrid Rubiscos may be catalytically competent they also highlight the difficulty of accurately predicting the outcome of such manipulations.

Transforming higher plant Rubiscos

Recent advances in chloroplast transformation have circumvented many of the previous obstacles to alter higher plant Rubisco. Moreover this approach allows the consequences for leaf photosynthesis and productivity to be determined. For example, in tobacco changing the loop 6 residue leucine 335 for valine decreased both specificity factor and carboxylation rates to 25% of the wild-type values; consequently, the plants were unable to survive without elevated CO₂ (Whitney *et al.*, 1999). Further mutations of this type not only have the potential to improve the specificity factor, but, more importantly, allow

analysis of consequential changes on the physiological properties of the whole plant.

Nuclear transformation has been used to relocate the plastid rbcL gene to the nucleus (Table 2). Agrobacteriummediated transformation of tobacco lacking the chloroplast rbcL with the rbcL coding region preceded by a plastid targeting sequence was able to supply the defective plastids with fully functional Rubisco (Kanevski and Maliga, 1994). Conversely, although rbcS relocated to the tobacco plastid genome folded correctly and assembled into active holoenzyme, it contributed less than 1% of the total small subunits in the holoenzyme. The scarcity of the transplastomic small subunits may result from inefficient translation or assembly, although the assembled small subunits were as stable as the native counterparts (Whitney and Andrews, 2001a). Of possible significance is the demonstration that sequences downstream of the translation initiation codon are important determinants of translation efficiency in chloroplasts (Kuroda and Maliga, 2001).

Models for photosynthesis suggest that at elevated CO₂ and temperatures below 25 °C Rubisco from the photosynthetic bacterium Chromatium vinosum should outperform higher plant Rubiscos (Bainbridge et al., 1995). However, attempts to use nuclear transformation to introduce the C. vinosum rbcL into Rubisco-deficient tobacco were not successful. Although the C. vinosum rbcL was transcribed into mRNA, no C. vinosum large subunits were detectable (Madgwick et al., 2002). Similarly, lines in which the native rbcL of tobacco was replaced with the cyanobacterial rbcL by chloroplast transformation had no large subunit protein or enzyme activity although mRNA was produced (Kanevski et al., 1999). The failure to recover a fully active enzyme could be caused by incompatibility between the large subunits and the small subunits or by inability of the foreign Rubisco subunits to fold or assemble efficiently in the plastid. Further attempts that avoided the problem of assembling hybrid enzymes involved introduction of both rbcL and rbcS operons of Galdieria sulphuraria and Phaeodactylum tricornutum into the inverted repeats of the

plastid genome of tobacco (Whitney *et al.*, 2001). Whilst the transgenes directed the synthesis of transcripts in abundance, the subunits of these foreign Rubiscos were insoluble, indicating problems with folding or assembly. In addition, the accumulation of large amounts of insoluble protein decreased the amount of tobacco Rubisco, CO₂ assimilation, and growth.

Greater promise has been shown by tobacco lines in which the native rbcL was replaced with rbcL from another higher plant, sunflower (Helianthus annuus), by means of chloroplast transformation, which produced a catalytically active enzyme composed of sunflower large subunits and tobacco small subunits (Kanevski et al., 1999). Whilst the specificity factor of this hybrid enzyme was similar to that of wild-type tobacco it had decreased affinities for both CO2 and ribulose bisphosphate and greatly decreased activity. The performance of a further line that expressed a chimeric (sunflower-tobacco) large subunit was similar to that of the other hybrid enzyme (Kanevski et al., 1999). Furthermore, Whitney and Andrews (2001b) were able successfully to replace the native rbcL of tobacco with rbcM from R. rubrum by chloroplast transformation and recover catalytically active Rubisco. The ability to recover active Rubisco protein probably reflects the simple dimeric structure of the holoenzyme and consequential simplicity of subunit assembly. Consistent with the kinetic properties of the R. rubrum Rubisco (whose specificity factor is very small) survival of these lines required elevated CO₂.

Clearly, the introduction of a high specificity factor Rubisco into crop plants remains a realistic goal. Modest changes in key catalytic properties achieved through small changes in *rbc*L sequences may have considerable significance to the whole plant (Sage, 2002). Such differences occur naturally amongst higher plants with high overall sequence homology. Further technological advances will expedite progress. These include developing chloroplast transformation techniques for the major crop species and overcoming the additional complexities of sufficient expression, post-translational modification, interaction with chaperonins and assembly (Gatenby and Ellis, 1990; Spreitzer and Salvucci, 2002). This remains a major challenge.

Selection

Even prior to the discovery of the oxygenase activity of Rubisco (Bowes *et al.*, 1971) there had been attempts to manipulate the specificity factor of Rubisco by selection. Such selection relied on maintaining plants at, or slightly above the compensation point; any plant with relatively low rates of photorespiration should thrive whereas plants with relatively high rates of photorespiration should die (Menz *et al.*, 1969; Cannell *et al.*, 1969). The method is very simple and offers the possibility of screening very large populations. The discovery of the oxygenase activity

stimulated further attempts to screen both different genotypes (Smith *et al.*, 1976; Nasyrov, 1978) and induced mutants (Medrano and Primo-Millo, 1985; Somerville and Somerville, 1986). However, in higher plants the method was not effective at selecting genotypes with increased specificity factor, but did identify some genotypes with improved capacity for dry matter accumulation (Medrano *et al.*, 1995) because of other characteristics.

Investigations with photosynthetic bacteria exploit the potential to screen very large populations (e.g. Rhodobacter sphaeroides and Rhodobacter capsulatus (Paoli and Tabita, 1998); cyanobacteria (Ogawa et al., 1994)). However, the potential of the unicellular green alga chlamydomonas in selection systems has been studied most. Changes in photosynthesis have been directly linked to alterations in the Rubisco large subunit gene (Spreitzer, 1993). Mutants were selected by requirement for acetate as a carbon source and then revertants that were no longer acetate-dependent were selected and characterized (Chen and Spreitzer, 1989; Chen et al., 1991; Thow et al., 1994; Spreitzer et al., 1995). Some of the revertants restored the gene sequence to the wild-type sequence while some were pseudo-revertants, with a second mutation that partly restored the ability to photosynthesize. The interpretation of these results was based on the crystal structures for tobacco and spinach Rubisco available at the time; now that the C. reinhardtii crystal structure is available (Taylor et al., 2001), this will aid both interpretation and future work in this area. These results, like those from sitedirected mutants, demonstrate how alterations in amino acids remote from the active site of an enzyme can play a significant role in the stability and function of Rubisco. However, in none of the revertants was the specificity factor greater than that of the wild type. Nevertheless, such non-directed approaches have greatly increased understanding about certain regions involved in catalysis.

In many cases, photosynthetic mutants have been isolated that are found to have mutations in genes that encode proteins involved in the control of Rubisco expression, rather than within Rubisco itself. The ability of such approaches to mutate and screen very large populations fully justifies their inclusion in future research projects.

Amount

The first successful genetic manipulation of the amount of Rubisco in a higher plant was by transformation of tobacco with a construct containing an antisense *rbc*S sequence (Rodermel *et al.*, 1988). This decreased the amount of Rubisco via a decrease in the level of endogenous *rbc*S transcript (Jiang *et al.*, 1994). Since then, the same antisense approach has been used to decrease the amount of Rubisco in tobacco (Hudson *et al.*, 1992), the C₄ plant *Flaveria bidentis* (Furbank *et al.*, 1996), rice (Makino

et al., 1997) and wheat (Mitchell et al., unpublished results). There have been several attempts to increase Rubisco content by overexpressing the rbcS gene, but these have failed, often resulting in decreased Rubisco content by cosuppression. Increases in Rubisco content on a leaf area basis have been observed in plants transformed with transgenes aimed at other targets (Pellny et al., 2002). In such cases, interpretation is equivocal, since other components may also have been altered (such as chlorophyll content in the example cited).

Effects on physiology of decreasing Rubisco content

Much of the physiological work on antisense-rbcS tobacco lines has been previously reviewed (Stitt and Krapp, 1999; Stitt and Schulze, 1994). Nearly all the results serve to confirm the existing hypotheses concerning the degree to which C₃ photosynthesis is limited by Rubisco content as represented in the model of Farquhar et al. (1980). Thus, decreasing Rubisco content decreased photosynthesis nearly proportionately at ambient CO2 and high light (Hudson et al., 1992; Lauerer et al., 1993). By contrast, there was little or no effect of small reductions under lightlimiting conditions (Hudson et al., 1992; Quick et al., 1991) or at elevated CO₂ (Stitt et al., 1991). Growth at low N supply lowers photosynthetic capacity and extremely low N supply results in photosynthesis being saturated by quite low growth light intensities. Thus decreased Rubisco content increasingly limits photosynthesis at lower N supplies (Quick et al., 1992). Decreased Rubisco content decreases the sink for electrons and thus photoprotective mechanisms are induced at lower light intensities (Schoefs et al., 2001). Transformants of the C₄ plant Flaveria bidentis with lower Rubisco content had lower photosynthetic rates, despite the high CO₂ concentration in the bundle sheath (Furbank et al., 1996). The amount of Rubisco in wild-type Flaveria plants must therefore be close to the point at which it would limit photosynthetic capacity. An unexpected result of lowering Rubisco content by antisense rbcS was that stomatal conductance was greater for a given photosynthetic rate, thus giving a higher internal CO₂ concentration in all species (Hudson et al., 1992; Makino et al., 1997; Stitt et al., 1991; von Caemmerer et al., 1997). There were differences in findings on whether a constant ratio to external CO₂ remained (Hudson et al., 1992; Stitt et al., 1991), but in any case the effect would be expected to lower the water-use efficiency of photosynthesis, and this is consistent with the greater C isotope discrimination seen in the transgenic plants (Hudson et al., 1992; von Caemmerer et al., 1997).

Possible benefits of decreasing Rubisco content under elevated CO2

It has been suggested that the increasing atmospheric CO₂ concentration makes a reduction in Rubisco amount desirable. This is because it becomes increasingly in excess for a given light environment as compared to other photosynthetic components which increasingly limit lightsaturated photosynthesis at high CO₂ (Makino *et al.*, 1997; Mitchell et al., 2000; Theobald et al., 1998). This depends on the extent to which acclimation to elevated CO₂ occurs to redress this balance. Excess Rubisco is only a problem when the resources invested in it could be usefully deployed elsewhere, for example, when growth is N-limited. It now seems clear that the reduction in Rubisco content at elevated CO₂ occurs only when there is demand for N elsewhere in the plant (Stitt and Krapp, 1999), which fits with this view. When N content of cereal leaves is decreased by low N supply or senescence, Rubisco decreases more than other photosynthetic components (Nakano et al., 1997; Theobald et al., 1998). In some cases acclimation to elevated CO₂ simply involves earlier leaf senescence that also has the net effect of a relatively larger decrease in Rubisco content. However, this acclimation is usually slow and incomplete (Medlyn, 1996; Sage, 1994). Nevertheless, decreasing the Rubisco content would increase the N-use efficiency both at elevated CO₂ and even at current CO₂ concentrations in moderate light environments (Mitchell et al., 2000).

No evidence of greater efficiency was found for tobacco antisense lines at elevated CO₂ (Masle et al., 1993; Quick et al., 1992). However, rice plants transformed with a construct with an antisense rbcS gene driven by the endogenous rbcS promoter (in contrast to the constitutive promoters used in other studies) did show increased photosynthetic rate at high CO₂ concentration for a given leaf N content (Makino et al., 1997). However, the benefit became less at lower leaf N content, so there may be less effect under N-limiting conditions. The growth of the transgenic plants was not greater than the wild type under conditions of saturating CO₂ concentration (Makino et al., 2000), but it is not clear whether N supply was limiting growth in this experiment. However, interesting traits associated with decreased Rubisco were identified, including greater allocation of N to leaves and delayed leaf senescence.

Future manipulation of Rubisco amount

There remains a case for continued attempts to decrease the Rubisco content of crops for nutrient-limited conditions as atmospheric CO₂ concentration increases. However, an important agronomic goal is to increase N uptake by crops during periods of high N supply following fertilizer application before it is lost into the environment. Since high plant N status suppresses N uptake (King et al., 1993), uptake may be stimulated by increasing N demand. In many crop species during vegetative growth, N is stored primarily as increased photosynthetic capacity in leaves, with a proportionally greater increase in Rubisco content.

1328 Parry et al.

There may therefore be a case for increasing photosynthetic capacity in crops under conditions of high N supply to maximize storage and decreasing it at low N supply to maximize N-use efficiency. These changes could be brought about using existing natural genetic variation or by direct genetic manipulation of the signalling processes that determine the amounts of Rubisco, given a better understanding of these than currently exists. Such approaches might overcome the undesirable pleiotropic effects of direct manipulation of *rbc*S expression, such as altering the link between photosynthetic rate and stomatal conductance, discussed above.

Regulation

The reversible formation of a carbamate by reaction of CO₂ with the amino group of a lysine residue in the catalytic site and its stabilization by Mg2+ is a basic mechanism underlying the control of Rubisco activity. However, since the carbamate group is directly involved in catalysis of both carboxylation and oxygenation, changing residues in Rubisco to change the reactivity of this lysyl residue are reflected in changes in activity. The identification and characterization (Somerville et al., 1982; Salvucci et al., 1985) of a mutant (rca) of arabidopsis (Arabidopsis thaliana), in which the carbamylation of the catalytic site lysine was impaired, because of the absence of another protein, Rubisco activase, has provided an alternative and adaptable target for changing the regulation of Rubisco activity in leaves. Rubisco activase has been likened to a molecular chaperone (Jimenéz et al., 1995) and there is clear evidence that it requires a binding site on Rubisco in order to facilitate carbamylation of the lysine residue. Thus Wang et al. (1992) showed that Rubisco activase from petunia or tobacco was not effective in the activation of Rubisco from spinach, barley, wheat, soybean, arabidopsis, pea, maize or chlamydomonas, in vitro. Conversely, Rubisco activase from barley or spinach was ineffective in the activation of Rubisco from petunia, tobacco or tomato. Larson et al. (1997) showed that changing proline 89 to arginine in the large subunit polypeptide of Rubisco from chlamydomonas rendered the enzyme susceptible to activation by tobacco Rubisco activase. Although the need for the formation of a complex between Rubisco and Rubisco activase has been established, no such complex has yet been crystallized to allow full structural characterization. Activation of Rubisco by Rubisco activase requires ATP (Streusand and Portis, 1987; Wang and Portis, 1992). Activation of Rubisco is decreased by a high ADP/ATP ratio (Robinson and Portis, 1989), and is increased by light through the operation of a ferredoxin/thioredoxin-linked mechanism involving redox-sensitive cysteine residues in Rubisco activase itself (Zhang and Portis, 1999).

Effects of decreasing Rubisco activase on Rubisco activity

The arabidopsis mutant (rca) completely lacking Rubisco activase is unable to survive in ambient air because the active site lysine does not become fully carbamylated. The mutant survives in air enriched with CO₂ where carbamylation is favoured (Somerville et al., 1982; Salvucci et al., 1985). Tobacco plants in which activase expression was decreased by transformation with antisense DNA showed no distinct phenotype until the activase was very low (Jiang et al., 1994; Mate et al., 1996; Hammond et al., 1998) although Mate et al. (1993) observed effects with even minor decreases in the activase activity. Slow growth of these transgenics was associated with decreased rates of photosynthesis although Rubisco amount in the tobacco leaves was increased, especially as the leaves aged. Plants with very little Rubisco activase needed CO2-enriched atmospheres for survival. Such transgenic plants eventually reached a size similar to the wild type because senescence was delayed (He et al., 1997). Transgenic arabidopsis plants with 40% of normal activase concentration showed decreased growth and photosynthesis compared to wild-type plants especially as light intensity was increased.

Recent interesting observations have been reported with the rca mutant of arabidopsis that has been transformed with DNA coding for either or both isoforms of the Rubisco activase normally found in this plant. The 46 kDa isoform contains unique C-terminal cysteine residues. In the absence of this isoform, but in the presence of the smaller 43 kDa isoform, the associated Rubisco was not down-regulated at night. This response involves a redoxsensitive disulphide formed between two cysteine residues in the C-terminus (Zhang and Portis, 1999) unique to the larger isoform. Substitution of either C-terminal cysteine for alanine diminished the ATP/ADP sensitivity of activase (Zhang and Portis, 1999) and the light responsiveness of Rubisco activity in vivo (Zhang et al., 2002). Further manipulations using arabidopsis rca plants have been described, into which either the 43 kDa or the 46 kDa isoform of activase were introduced. Rubisco activity in plants expressing the shorter isoform was not downregulated following a light-dark transition, while that in plants expressing the larger isoform was strongly downregulated (Zhang et al., 2002).

Future prospects for manipulating Rubisco regulation

Evidence is accumulating showing that Rubisco activase may be more susceptible to heat denaturation *in vivo* than Rubisco (Feller *et al.*, 1998; Crafts-Brandner *et al.*, 1997; Crafts-Brandner and Salvucci, 2000; Rokka *et al.*, 2001). Thus there may be scope for over-expression of Rubisco activase, or changing it to a more stable form, to make plants more fitted to stressful or extreme environments.

CA1P is responsible for low activities of Rubisco in many species in darkness and low light. Rubisco activase releases CA1P from the carbamylated sites of Rubisco (Robinson and Portis, 1988) after which CA1P may be rendered non-inhibitory by the action of a specific, lightmodulated phosphatase. The phosphatase has been purified and the gene coding for it should soon be available. The effect of manipulating the abundance of the CA1P phosphatase on CA1P abundance and Rubisco activity will be of considerable interest. It may be possible to change the activity of Rubisco activase by light, redox regulators, or exposure to elevated temperature, so that CA1P is not released from the catalytic sites of Rubisco. Alternatively, the amount of CA1P may be increased by decreasing the expression of CA1P phosphatase. In either case, earlier investigations (Mehta et al., 1992; Khan et al., 1999) suggest that Rubisco would then be protected from proteolysis. It should soon be possible to test this hypothesis.

Alternative means of manipulating Rubisco activity may arise once genes for the enzymes involved in the synthesis of CA1P have been identified. Very strong evidence is available for the pathway of synthesis of CA1P from fructose 1,6-bisphosphate in the chloroplast involving the sugar hamamelose (Andralojc et al., 2002), but none of the enzymes involved have been characterized and none of the genes coding for these enzymes have been identified.

At least three other tight-binding inhibitors of Rubisco occur naturally, but these may be merely misfire products of Rubisco catalysis. Little is known about the factors controlling the amounts of these inhibitors in steady-state photosynthesis and manipulation of these factors to control Rubisco activity cannot yet be envisaged. Several phosphorylated metabolites in the chloroplast are competitive inhibitors of Rubisco activity or of its carbamylation (Portis, 1992; Parry et al., 1999). Mutations and genetic manipulation affecting chloroplast metabolism may be expected to change steady-state concentrations of such metabolites in the chloroplast and, consequently, affect Rubisco activity. Glyoxylate is thought to be increased in certain photorespiratory mutants (Wingler et al., 1999) and to decrease the activation of Rubisco (Cook et al., 1985).

Acknowledgement

Rothamsted-Research is a grant-aided institute of the BBSRC.

References

- Andersson I. 1996. Large structures at high resolution: the 1.6 angstrom crystal structure of spinach ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase complexed with 2-carboxyarabinitol bisphosphate. Journal of Molecular Biology 259, 160-174.
- Andersson I, Knight S, Schneider G, Lindqvist Y, Lindqvst T, Branden CI, Lorimer GH. 1989. Crystal structure of the active

- site of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase. Nature 337, 229-234.
- Andralojc PJ, Keys AJ, Kossmann J, Parry MAJ. 2002. Elucidating the biosynthesis of 2-carboxyarabinitol 1-phosphate through reduced expression of chloroplastic fructose 1,6bisphosphate phosphatase and radiotracer studies with (CO₂)-C-14. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 99, 4742-4747.
- Andrews TJ, Lorimer GH. 1978. Photorespiration still unavoidable? FEBS Letters 90, 1-9.
- Bainbridge G, Madgwick P, Parmar S, Mitchell R, Paul M, Pitts J, Keys AJ, Parry MAJ. 1995. Engineering rubisco to change its catalytic properties. Journal of Experimental Botany 46, 1269-1276.
- Bainbridge G, Andralojc PJ, Madgwick PJ, Pitts JE, Parry MAJ. 1998. Effect of mutation of lysine-128 of the large subunit of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase from Anacystis nidulans. Biochemical Journal 336, 387-393.
- Bowes G, Ogren WL, Hageman R. 1971. Phosphoglycolate production catalysed by ribulose diphsophate carboxylase. Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications 45, 716-722.
- Bradley D, Van der Vies SM, Gatenby A. 1986. Expression of cyanobacterial and higher plant ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase genes in Escherichia coli. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London 313, 305–324.
- Cannell RQ, Bruns WA, Moss DN. 1969. A search for high net photosynthetic rate among soybean genotypes. Crop Science 9, 840-841.
- Chan PH, Sakano K, Singh S, Wildman SG. 1972. Crystalline fraction 1 protein: preparation in large yield. Science 176, 1145-
- Chan PH, Wildman SG. 1972. Chloroplast DNA codes for the primary structure of the large subunit of Fraction 1 protein. Biochimica et Biophysica Acta 277, 677–680.
- Chapman MS, Won Suh S, Currie PMG, Cascio D, Smith WW, **Eisenberg D.** 1988. Tertiary structure of plant Rubisco: domains and their contacts. Science 241, 71-74.
- Chen Z, Spreitzer RJ. 1989. Chloroplast intragenic supression enhances the low specificity of mutant ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase. Journal of Biological Chemistry 264, 3051-3053.
- Chen ZX, Yu WZ, Lee JH, Diao R, Spreitzer RJ. 1991. Complementing amino-acid substitutions within loop-6 of the alpha-beta-barrel active-site influence the CO₂/O₂ specificity of chloroplast ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase. Biochemistry 30, 8846-8850.
- Chène P, Day AG, Fersht AR. 1992. Mutation of asparagine 111 of Rubisco from Rhodospirillum rubrum alters the carboxylase/ oxygenase specificity. Journal of Molecular Biology 225, 891-
- Cleland WW, Andrews TJ, Gutteridge S, Hartman FC, Lorimer **GH.** 1998. Mechanism of Rubisco: the carbamate as general base. Chemical Reviews **98**, 549–561.
- Collatz GJ, Berry JA, Farquhar GD, Pierce J. 1990. The relationship between the Rubisco reaction mechanism and models of photosynthesis. Plant, Cell and Environment 13, 219-225.
- Cook CM, Mulligan RM, Tolbert NE. 1985. Inhibition and stimulation of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase by glyoxylate. Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics 240, 392-401.
- Crafts-Brandner SJ, Salvucci ME. 2000. Rubisco activase constrains the photosynthetic potential of leaves at high temperature and CO₂. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 97, 13430-13435.
- Crafts-Brandner SJ, Van De Loo FJ, Salvucci ME. 1997. The

- two forms of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activase differ in sensitivity to elevated temperature. *Plant Physiology* **114**, 439–444.
- Dalling MJ, Boland G, Wilson JH. 1976. Relation between acid proteinase activity and redistribution of nitrogen during grain development in wheat. Australian Journal of Plant Physiology 3, 721–730.
- **Edwards GE, Walker DA.** 1983. *C*₃, *C*₄-Mechanisms and cellular and environmental regulation of photosynthesis. Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Ellis RJ. 1979. The most abundant protein in the world. *Trends in Biochemical Science* **4**, 241–244.
- Ellis RJ. 1981. Chloroplast proteins: synthesis, transport and assembly. *Annual Review of Plant Physiology* **32**, 111–137.
- **Farquhar GD, Von Caemmerer S, Berry JA.** 1980. A biochemical model of photosynthetic CO₂ assimilation in leaves of C-3 species. *Planta* **149**, 78–90.
- **Feller U, Crafts-Brandner SJ, Salvucci ME.** 1998. Moderately high temperatures inhibit ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) activase-mediated activation of Rubisco. *Plant Physiology* **116**, 539–546.
- Furbank RT, Chitty JA, von Caemmerer S, Jenkins CLD. 1996. Antisense RNA inhibition of *rbc*S gene expression reduces Rubisco level and photosynthesis in the C-4 plant *Flaveria bidentis*. *Plant Physiology* **111**, 725–734.
- **Gatenby AA, Castleton JA, Saul MW.** 1981. Expression in *E. coli* of maize and wheat chloroplast genes for large subunit of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase. *Nature* **291,** 117–121.
- Gatenby AA, Ellis RJ. 1990. Chaperone function—the assembly of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase. Annual Review of Cell Biology 6, 125–149.
- **Gatenby A, Van der Vies SM, Bradley D.** 1985. Assembly in *E. coli* of a functional multisubunit ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase from blue-green alga. *Nature* **314,** 617–620.
- **Gutteridge S, Gatenby AA.** 1995. Rubisco synthesis, assembly, mechanism and regulation. *The Plant Cell* **7,** 809–819.
- Gutteridge S, Rhoades DF, Herrmann C. 1993. Site-specific mutations in a loop region of the C-terminal domain of the large subunit of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase that influence substrate partitioning. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 268, 7818–7824.
- **Gutteridge S, Sigal I, Thomas B, Arentzen R, Cordova A, Lorimer GH.** 1984. A site-specific mutation within the active site of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase of *Rhodospirillum rubrum. EMBO Journal* **3,** 2737–2743.
- **Hammond ET, Andrews TJ, Woodrow IE.** 1998. Regulation of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase by carbamylation and 2-carboxyarabinitol 1-phosphate in tobacco: insights from studies of antisense plants containing reduced amounts of Rubisco activase. *Plant Physiology* **118**, 1463–1471.
- **Hartman FC, Lee EH.** 1989. Examination of the function of the active site lysine 329 of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase as revealed by proton exchange reactions. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* **246**, 11784–11789.
- **Hatch MD.** 1976. Photosynthesis: the path of carbon. In: Bonner J, Varner J, eds. *Plant biochemistry*, 3rd edn. New York, San Francisco, London: Academic Press, 797–844.
- He ZL, von Caemmerer S, Hudson GS, Price GD, Badger MR, Andrews TJ. 1997. Ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/ oxygenase activase deficiency delays senescence of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase, but progressively impairs its catalysis during tobacco leaf development. *Plant Physiology* 115, 1569–1580.
- Hudson GS, Evans JR, von Caemmerer S, Arvidsson YBC,
 Andrews TJ. 1992. Reduction of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate
 carboxylase oxygenase content by antisense RNA reduces

- photosynthesis in transgenic tobacco plants. *Plant Physiology* **98**, 294–302.
- **Jiang CZ, Kliebenstien D Ke N, Rodermel S.** 1994. Destabilization of *rbc*S sense transcripts by antisense RNA. *Plant Molecular Biology* **25,** 569–576.
- Jimenéz ES, Medrano L, Martínez-Barajas E. 1995. Rubisco activase, a possible new member of the molecular chaperone family. *Biochemistry* 34, 2826–2831.
- Kane HJ, VIIL, Entsch B, Paul K, Morell MK, Andrews TJ. 1994. An improved method for measuring the CO₂/O₂ specificity of ribulose bishosphate carboxylase-oxygenase. *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology* **21**, 449–461.
- **Kanevski I, Maliga P.** 1994. Relocation of the plastid *rbc*L gene to the nucleus yields functional ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase in tobacco chloroplasts. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* **5**, 1969–1973.
- Kanevski I, Maliga P, Rhoades DF, Gutteridge S. 1999. Plastome engineering of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphatecarboxylase/oxygenase in tobacco to form a sunflower large subunit and tobacco small subunit hybrid. *Plant Physiology* **119**, 133–141.
- **Kawashima N, Wildman SG.** 1972. Studies of fraction protein. IV. Mode of inheritance of primary structure in relation to whether chloroplast or nuclear DNA contains the code for a chloroplastic protein. *Biochimica et Biophysica Acta* **262**, 42–49.
- Khan S, Andralojc PJ, Lea PJ, Parry MAJ. 1999. 2'-carboxy-D-arabinitol 1-phosphate (CA1P) protects ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase against proteolytic breakdown. *European Journal of Biochemsitry* **266**, 840–847.
- King BJ, Siddiqi MY, Ruth TJ, Warner RL, Glass ADM. 1993. Feedback-regulation of nitrate influx in barley roots by nitrate, nitrite and ammonium. *Plant Physiology* **102**, 1279–1286.
- Knight S, Andersson I, Branden CI. 1990. Crystallographic analysis of ribulose1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase from spinach at 2.4 A resolution. *Journal of Molecular Biology* 215, 113–160.
- **Kung SD.** 1976. Tobacco fraction 1 protein: a unique genetic marker. *Science* **191**, 429–434.
- **Kuroda H, Maliga P.** 2001. Sequences downstream of the translation initiation codon are important determinants of translation efficiency in chloroplasts. *Plant Physiology* **125**, 430–436.
- **Larson EM, Larimer FW, Hartman FC.** 1995. Mechanistic insights provided by deletion of a flexible loop at the active site of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase. *Biochemistry* **34**, 4531–4537.
- Larson EM, O'Brien CM, Zhu GH, Spreitzer RJS, Portis AR. 1997. Specificity for activase is changed by a Pro 89 to Arg substitution in the large subunit of ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 272, 17033–17037.
- Lauerer M, Saftic D, Quick WP, Labate C, Fichtner K, Schulze ED, Rodermel SR, Bogorad L, Stitt M. 1993. Decreased ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase in transgenic tobacco transformed with antisense rbcs. VI. Effect on photosynthesis in plants grown at different irradiance. *Planta* 190, 332–345.
- **Lee GJ, Mcdonald KA, Mcfadden BA.** 1993. Leucine-332 influences the CO₂/O₂ specificity factor of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase from *Anacystis-nidulans*. *Protein Science* **2,** 1147–1154.
- **Lorimer GH.** 1981. The carboxylation and oxygenation of ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate: the primary events in photosynthesis and photorespiration. *Annual Review of Plant Physiology* **32**, 349–383.
- **Lorimer GH, Miziorko HM.** 1980. Carbamate formation on the ε-amino group of a lysyl residue as the basis for the activation of

- Mg^{2+} . ribulosebisphosphate carboxylase by CO_2 and Biochemistry 19, 5321-5324.
- Madgwick PJ, Colliver SP, Banks FM, Habash DZ, Dulieu H, Parry MAJ, Paul MJ. 2002. Genetic manipulation of rubisco: Chromatium vinosum rbcL is expressed in Nicotiana tabacum but does not form a functional protein. Annals of Applied Biology **140,** 13–19.
- Madgwick PJ, Parmar S, Parry MAJ. 1998. Effect of mutations of residue 340 in the large subunit polypeptide of Rubisco from Anacystis nidulans. European Journal of Biochemistry 253, 476-
- Makino A, Harada M, Kaneko K, Mae T, Shimada T, Yamamoto N. 2000. Whole-plant growth and allocation in transgenic rice plants with decreased content of ribulose-1,5bisphosphate carboxylase under different CO₂ partial pressures. Australian Journal of Plant Physiology 27, 1–12.
- Makino A, Shimada T, Takumi S, Kaneko K, Matsuoka M, Shimamoto K, Nakano H, Miyao-Tokutomi M, Mae T, Yamamoto N. 1997. Does decrease in ribulose-1,5,bisphosphate carboxylase by 'antisense' rbcS lead to a higher nitrogen-use efficiency of photosynthesis under conditions of saturating CO2 and light in rice plants? Plant Physiology 114,
- Masle J, Hudson GS, Badger MR. 1993. Effects of ambient CO₂ concentration on growth and nitrogen use in tobacco (Nicotiana tabacum) plants transformed with an antisense gene to the smallsubunit of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase. Plant Physiology 103, 1075-1088.
- Mate CJ, Hudson GS, von Caemmerer S, Evans JR, Andrews TJ. 1993. Reduction of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase activase levels in tobacco (Nicotiana tabacum) by antisense RNA reduces ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase carbamylation and impairs photosynthesis. Plant Physiology 102, 1119-1128.
- Mate CJ, von Caemmerer S, Evans JR, Hudson GS, Andrews TJ. 1996. The relationship between CO₂-assimilation rate, Rubisco carbamylation and Rubisco activase content in activase-deficient transgenic tobacco suggests a simple model of activase action. Planta 198, 604-613.
- Medlyn BE. 1996. The optimal allocation of nitrogen within the C-3 photosynthetic system at elevated CO2. Australian Journal of Plant Physiology 23, 593-603.
- Medrano H, Keys AJ, Lawlor DW, Parry MAJ, Azcon Bieto J, Delgado E. 1995. Improving plant-production by selection for survival at low CO₂ concentrations. Journal of Experimental Botany 46, 1389-1396.
- Medrano H, Primo-Millo E. 1985. Selection of Nicotiana tabacum haploids of high photosynthetic efficiency. Plant Physiology 79,
- Mehta RA, Fawcett TW, Porath D, Mattoo AK. 1992. Oxidative stress causes rapid membrane translocation and in vivo ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate of degradation carboxvlase/ oxygenase. Journal of Biological Chemistry 267, 2810-2816.
- Menz KM, Moss DN, Cannell RQ, Brun WA. 1969. Screening for photosynthetic efficiency. Crop Science 9, 692-694.
- Millard P, Catt JW. 1988. The influence of nitrogen supply on the use of nitrate and ribulose1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/ oxygenase as leaf nitrogen stores for growth of potato tubers (Solanum tuberosum L.). Journal of Experimental Botany 39, 1-11.
- Mitchell RAC, Theobald JC, Parry MAJ, Lawlor DW. 2000. Is there scope for improving balance between RUBP-regeneration and carboxylation capacities in wheat at elevated CO₂? Journal of Experimental Botany 51, 391–397.
- Nakano H, Makino A, Mae T. 1997. The effect of elevated partial pressures of CO₂ on the relationship between photosynthetic

- capacity and N content in rice leaves. Plant Physiology 115, 191-
- Nasyrov YS. 1978. Genetic control of photosynthesis and improving of crop productivity. Annual Review of Plant Physiology 29, 215-237.
- Newman A, Gutteridge S. 1993. The X-ray structure of Synechoccus ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activated quaternary complex at 2.2 Å resolution. Journal of Biological Chemistry 268, 25876-25886.
- Ogawa T, Amichay D, Gurevitz M. 1994. isolation and characterization of the ccmm gene required by cyanobacterium Synechocystis PCC6803 for inorganic carbon utilization. Photosynthesis Research 39,183-190.
- Ogren WL. 1984. Photorespiration: pathways, regulation and modification. Annual Review of Plant Physiology 35, 415-442.
- Ogren WL, Bowes G. 1971. Ribulose diphosphate carboxylase regulates soybean photorespiration. Nature New Biology 230, 159-160.
- Paoli GC, Tabita FR. 1998. Aerobic chemolithoautotrophic growth and Rubisco function in Rhodobacter capsulatus and a spontaneous gain of function mutant of Rhodobacter sphaeroides. Archives of Microbiology 170, 8-17.
- Parry MAJ, Keys AJ, Gutteridge S. 1989. Variation in the specificity factor of C-3 higher-plant Rubisco determined by the total consumption of ribulose-P-2. Journal of Experimental Botany 40, 317-320.
- Parry MAJ, Loveland JE, Andralojc PJ. 1999. Regulation of Rubisco. In: Bryant JA, Burrell MM, Kruger NJ, eds. Plant carbohdrate biochemistry. Oxford: Bios Scientific Publishers Ltd,
- Parry MAJ, Madgwick P, Parmar S, Cornelius MJ, Keys AJ. 1992. Mutations in loop six of the large subunit of ribulose-1,5bisphosphate carboxylase affect substrate specificity. Planta 187, 109-112.
- Pellny T, Paul MJ, Goddijn JM. 2002. Unravelling the role of trehalose-6-phosphate in metabolic signalling in photosynthetic tissue. Comparative Biochemsitry and Physiology 132, S102.
- Peoples MB, Pate JS, Atkins CA. 1983. Mobilization of nitrogen in fruiting plants of a cultivar of cowpea. Journal of Experimental Botany 34, 563-578.
- Portis AR. 1990. Partial reduction in ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activity by carboxypeptidase A. Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics 283, 397-400.
- Portis AR. 1992. Regulation of ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activity. Annual Review of Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology 43, 415-437.
- Quick WP, Fichtner K, Schulze ED, Wendler R, Leegood RC, Mooney H, Rodermel SR, Bogorad L, Stitt M. 1992. Decreased ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase in transgenic tobacco transformed with antisense rbcs. 4. impact on photosynthesis in conditions of altered nitrogen supply. Planta **188**, 522–531.
- Quick WP, Schurr U, Scheibe R, Schulze ED, Rodermel SR, **Bogorad L. Stitt M.** 1991. Decreased ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase in transgenic tobacco transformed with antisense rbcs. 1. Impact on photosynthesis in ambient growthconditions. Planta 183, 542-554.
- Read BA, Tabita FR. 1992. A hybrid ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase enzyme exhibiting a substantial increase in substrate-specificity. Biochemistry 31, 5553-5560.
- Read BA, Tabita FR. 1994. High substrate-specificity factor ribulose-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase from eukaryotic marine-algae and properties of recombinant cyanobacterial Rubisco containing algal residue modifications. Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics 312, 210-218.
- Ramage RT, Read BA, Tabita FR. 1998. Alteration of the alpha

- helix region of cyanobacterial ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase to reflect sequences found in high substrate specificity enzymes. *Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics* **349**, 81–88.
- **Reynolds MP, van Ginkel M, Ribaut JM.** 2000. Avenues for genetic modification of radiation use efficiency in wheat. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **51,** 459–473.
- **Robinson SP, Portis AR.** 1988. Release of the nocturnal inhibitor, carboxyarabinitol-1-phosphate, from ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase by Rubisco activase. *FEBS Letters* **233**, 413–416.
- **Robinson SP, Portis AR.** 1989. Adenosine triphosphate hydrolysis by purified Rubisco activase. *Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics* **268**, 93–99.
- **Rodermel SR, Abbott MS, Bogorad L.** 1988. Nuclear–organelle interactions—nuclear antisense gene inhibits ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase enzyme levels in transformed tobacco plants. *Cell* **55**, 673–681.
- Rokka A, Zhang L, Aro EM. 2001. Rubisco activase: an enzyme with a temperature-dependent dual function? *The Plant Journal* 25, 463–471.
- Sage RF. 1994. Acclimation of photosynthesis to increasing atmospheric CO₂—the gas-exchange perspective. *Photosynthesis Research* 39, 351–368.
- **Sage RF.** 2002. Variation in the k_{cat} of Rubisco in C₃ and C₄ plants and some implications for photosynthetic performance at high and low temperature. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **53**, 609–620.
- Salvucci ME, Portis AR, Ogren WL. 1985. A soluble chloroplast protein catalyzes ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activation *in vivo*. *Photosynthesis Research* **7**, 193–201.
- Schneider G, Lindqvist Y, Branden CI, Lorimer GH. 1986. Three dimensional structure of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase from *Rhodospirillum rubrum* at 2.9 Å resolution. *EMBO Journal* 5, 3409–3415.
- Schoefs B, Darko E, Rodermel S. 2001. Photosynthetic pigments, photosynthesis and plastid ultrastructure in *rbc*S antisense DNA mutants of tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*). Zeitschrift für Naturforschung **56**, 1067–1074.
- Smith EW, Tolbert NE, Ku HS. 1976. Variables affecting the CO₂ compensation point. *Plant Physiology* 58, 143.
- **Somerville CR, Portis AR, Ogren WL.** 1982. A mutant of *Arabidopsis thaliana* which lacks activation of RUBP carboxylase *in vivo. Plant Physiology* **70,** 381–387.
- **Somerville CR, Somerville SC.** 1984. Cloning and expression of the *Rhodospirillum rubrum* ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase gene in *E. coli. Molecular and General Genetics* **193,** 214–219.
- Somerville CR, Somerville SC. 1986. Regulation of photorespiration. In: Neyra CA, ed. *A biochemical basis of plant breeding*, Vol. I. Boca Raton (Florida): CRC Press, Inc., 89–131.
- Soper TS, Larimer FW, Mural RJ, Lee EH, Hartman FC. 1992. Role of asparagine 111 at the active site of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase from *Rhodospirillum rubrum* as demonstrated by site directed mutagenesis. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* **267**, 8452–8457.
- Soper TS, Mural RJ, Larimer FW, Lee EH, Machanoff R, Hartman FC. 1988. Essentiality of Lys-329 of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase from *Rhodospirillum rubrum* as demonstrated by site-directed mutagenesis. *Protein Engineering* 2, 39–44.
- Spreitzer RJ. 1993. Genetic dissection of Rubisco structure and function. Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology 44, 411–434.
- Spreitzer RJ. 1999. Questions about the complexity of chloroplast

- ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase. *Phostosynthesis Research* **60**, 29–42.
- **Spreitzer RJ, Salvucci ME.** 2002. Rubisco: structure, regulatory interactions, and possibilities for a better enzyme. *Annual Review of Plant Biology* **53**, 449–475.
- **Spreitzer RJ, Thow G, Zhu GH.** 1995. Pseudoreversion substitution at large-subunit residue-54 influences the CO₂/O₂ specificity of chloroplast ribulose-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase. *Plant Physiology* **109**, 681–685.
- **Steer MW, Gunning BES, Graham TA, Carr DJ.** 1966. Isolation and properties of fraction 1 protein from *Avena sativa L. Planta* **79,** 256–267.
- Stitt M, Krapp A. 1999. The interaction between elevated carbon dioxide and nitrogen nutrition: the physiological and molecular background. *Plant, Cell and Environment* 22, 583–621.
- Stitt M, Quick WP, Schurr U, Schulze ED, Rodermel SR, Bogorad L. 1991. Decreased ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase in transgenic tobacco transformed with antisense rbcs. 2. flux-control coefficients for photosynthesis in varying light, CO₂ and air humidity. *Planta* 183, 555–566.
- **Stitt M, Schulze D.** 1994. Does Rubisco control the rate of photosynthesis and plant-growth—an exercise in molecular ecophysiology. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **17,** 465–487.
- **Streusand VJ, Portis AR.** 1987. Rubisco activase mediates ATP-dependent activation of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase. *Plant Physiology* **85**, 152–154.
- Sugawara H, Yamamoto H, Shihata N, Inoue T, Okada S, Miyake C, Yokota A, Kai Y. 1999. Crystal structure of carboxylase reaction-oriented ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase from a thermophilic red alga, *Galdieria partita*. Journal of Biological Chemistry 274, 15655–15661.
- **Taylor TC, Backlund A, Bjorhall K, Spreitzer RJ, Andersson I.** 2001. First crystal structure of Rubisco from a green alga, *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii. Journal of Biological Chemistry* **276,** 48159–48164.
- **Theobald JC, Mitchell RAC, Parry MAJ, Lawlor DW.** 1998. Estimating the excess investment in ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase in leaves of spring wheat grown under elevated CO₂. *Plant Physiology* **118**, 945–955.
- **Thow G, Zhu GH, Spreitzer RJ.** 1994. Complementing substitutions within loop region-2 and region-3 of the alpha/beta-barrel active-site influence the CO₂/O₂ specificity of chloroplast ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase. *Biochemistry* **33**, 5109–5114.
- Uemura K, Suzuki Y, Shikanai T, Wadano A, Jensen RG, Chmara W, Yokota A. 1996. A rapid and sensitive method for determination of relative specificity of Rubisco from various species by anion exchange chromatography. *Plant Cell Physiology* 37, 325–331.
- von Caemmerer S, Millgate A, Farquhar GD, Furbank RT. 1997. Reduction of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/ oxygenase by antisense RNA in the C-4 plant *Flaveria bidentis* leads to reduced assimilation rates and increased carbon isotope discrimination. *Plant Physiology* 113, 469–477.
- Wang Z-Y, Snyder GW, Esau BD, Portis AR, Ogren WL. 1992. Species dependent variation in the interaction of substrate-bound ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) and Rubisco activase. *Plant Physiology* **100**, 1858–1862.
- Wang ZY, Portis AR. 1992. Dissociation of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate bound to ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase and its enhancement by ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activase-mediated hydrolysis of ATP. *Plant Physiology* **99**, 1348–1353.
- Wang YL, Zhou JH, Wang YF, Bao JS, Chen HB. 2001. Properties of hybrid enzymes between *Synechococcus* large subunits and higher plant small subunits of ribulose-1,5-

- bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase in Escherichia coli. Archives of Biochemistry and Biophysics 396, 35-42.
- Warburg O. 1920. Über die Geschwindigkeit der photochemischen Kohlensâurezersetung in lebenden Zellen II. Biochemische Zeitschrift 100, 188–217.
- Whitney SM, Andrews TJ. 2001a. The gene for the ribulose-1,5bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) small subunit relocated to the plastid genome of tobacco directs the synthesis of small subunits that assemble into Rubisco. The Plant Cell 13, 193-205.
- Whitney SM, Andrews TJ. 2001b. Plastome-encoded bacterial ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) supports photosynthesis and growth in tobacco. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 98, 14738-14743.
- Whitney SM, Baldett P, Hudson GS, Andrews TJ. 2001. Form I Rubiscos from non-green algae are expressed abundantly but not assembled in tobacco chloroplasts. The Plant Journal 26, 535-
- Whitney SM, von Caemmerer S, Hudson GS, Andrews TJ. 1999. Directed mutation of the Rubisco large subunit of tobacco influences photorespiration and growth. Plant Physiology 121, 579-588.
- Wildner GF. 1981. Ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-

- oxygenase; aspects and products. Physiologia Plantarum 52, 385-389.
- Wingler A, Lea PJ, Leegood RC. 1999. Photorespiratory metabolism of glyoxylate and formate in glycine-accumulating mutants of barley and Amaranthus edulis. Planta 207, 518-526.
- Zhang N, Portis AR. 1999. Mechanism of light regulation of Rubisco: a specific role for the larger Rubisco activase isoform involving reductive activation by thioredoxin-f. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 96, 9438-9443.
- Zhang N, Kallis RP, Ewy RG, Portis AR. 2002. Light modulation of Rubisco in Arabidopsis requires a capacity for redox regulation of the larger Rubisco activase isoform. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA. 99, 3330-3334.
- Zhu GH, Jensen RG, Bohnert HJ, Wildner GF, Schlitter J. 1998. Dependence of catalysis and CO₂/O₂ specificity of Rubisco on the carboxy-terminus of the large subunit different temperatures. Photosynthesis Research 57, 71-79.
- Zhu GH, Spreitzer RJ. 1996. Directed mutagenesis of chloroplast ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase—Loop substitutions complement for structural stability but decrease catalytic efficiency. Journal of Biological Chemistry 271, 18494– 18498.