

# Is there scope for improving balance between RuBP-regeneration and carboxylation capacities in wheat at elevated CO<sub>2</sub>?

## R.A.C. Mitchell<sup>1</sup>, J.C. Theobald, M.A.J. Parry and D.W. Lawlor

Biochemistry and Physiology Department, IACR-Rothamsted, Harpenden, Herts. AL5 2JQ, UK

Received 19 April 1999; Accepted 29 September 1999

## Abstract

Carboxylation and RuBP-regeneration capacities, which determine light-saturated photosynthetic rate, were analysed in leaves of spring wheat (Triticum aestivum L. cv. Minaret) grown under different atmospheric  $CO_2$  partial pressure ( $pC_a$ ) and N supply regimes. Capacities were estimated from a large number of gas exchange, Rubisco and ATP-synthase content measurements, and from these, the  $pC_a$  at which the two capacities are equal was derived, to allow direct comparison with growth pCa. Acclimation of the balance between the two capacities to growth at elevated pC<sub>a</sub> in wheat was only partial and appears to occur mostly in older flag leaves and at low N. However, in contrast to conclusions drawn from previous analyses of these data, there was evidence of a specific effect of growth at 70 Pa pCa, where carboxylation capacity is reduced more than RuBP-regeneration capacity for a given leaf N content. A model was used to estimate the effects of fluctuations in PPFD and temperature in the growth environment on the optimal balance between these capacities. This showed that the observed balance between carboxylation and RuBP-regeneration capacities in young wheat leaves could be consistent with adaptation to the current, or even the preindustrial  $pC_{a}$ .

Key words: *Triticum aestivum*, carboxylation, RuBP regeneration, carbon dioxide, nitrogen, photosynthesis.

## Introduction

The current atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressure  $(pC_a)$  is already the highest experienced by plants at any time over at least the last 160 000 years (Barnola *et al.*, 1987), possibly for several million years, and is rapidly increasing. There may therefore be opportunities to improve the adaptation of photosynthesis of C<sub>3</sub> crops, since their recent ancestors evolved under lower  $pC_a$ . Furthermore, there is evidence that breeding has increased stomatal conductance in wheat (Fischer *et al.*, 1998), thereby further increasing the CO<sub>2</sub> at the site of carboxylation  $(pC_c)$  compared to that experienced by wheat ancestors.

One consequence of increasing  $pC_a$  is that carboxylation by Rubisco becomes more efficient compared with RuBPregeneration and other processes. For maximum photosynthesis (A) per unit leaf N (N-use efficiency), a decrease in Rubisco relative to RuBP-regeneration components is therefore theoretically required at high  $pC_a$  (Medlyn, 1996; Sage, 1994). This theory is supported by observations in plants where the amount of Rubisco has been decreased by genetic manipulation. In tobacco, the amount of Rubisco in leaves of plants grown at ambient

<sup>1</sup> To whom correspondence should be addressed. Fax: +44 1582 763010. E-mail: rowan.mitchell@bbsrc.ac.uk

Abbreviations:  $\alpha$ , fraction of incident light usefully absorbed by photosystems;  $\beta$ ,  $pC_i/pC_a$  ratio;  $\Gamma$ , photorespiratory compensation point;  $\theta$ , curvature of photosynthetic light response;  $\tau$ , Rubisco specificity factor; A, light-saturated net CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation rate;  $A_g$ , light-saturated CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation rate gross of non-photorespiratory respiration;  $g_{w}$ , conductance for diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> from intercellular space to site of carboxylation;  $J_{max}$ , maximum rate of non-cyclic photosynthetic electron transport;  $K_c$ , Rubisco Michaelis constant for CO<sub>2</sub>;  $K_o$ , Rubisco Michaelis constant for O<sub>2</sub>;  $N_{RC}$ , relative N cost of investing in RuBP-regeneration capacity compared to carboxylation capacity;  $pC_a$ , atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressure;  $pC_{a,bal}$ ,  $pC_a$  at which carboxylation and RuBP-regeneration capacities are equal;  $pC_c$ , CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressure at site of carboxylation;  $pC_{c,bal}$ ,  $pC_c$  at which carboxylation and RuBP-regeneration capacities are equal;  $pC_i$ , CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressure in intercellular space; PPFD, photosynthetically-active photon flux density; RuBP, ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate; Rubisco, RuBP carboxylase/oxygenase;  $V_{cmax}$ , maximum rate of carboxylation.

pC<sub>a</sub> largely determines light-saturated photosynthetic rate, but does not limit photosynthesis at elevated  $pC_a$ (Quick et al., 1992) and the  $pC_a$  at which RuBP-regeneration begins to limit photosynthesis is much higher in plants with decreased Rubisco content (Masle et al., 1993; von Caemmerer et al., 1994). In a comparison of rice lines grown at ambient  $pC_a$ , those with decreased Rubisco content had a greater N-use efficiency measured at high pC<sub>a</sub> (Makino et al., 1997). However, there remains the question of whether there are acclimatory responses to long-term growth at elevated CO<sub>2</sub> such that any excess investment in Rubisco is decreased or removed. Reviews of gas exchange studies (Medlyn, 1996; Sage, 1994) have concluded that there is evidence of some rebalancing occurring under certain conditions (particularly nutrient deficiency), but usually it is less than the predicted optimum and often there is none. A large (60%) decrease in Rubisco content relative to wild type in transgenic tobacco plants had a smaller relative effect on growth at elevated compared to ambient  $pC_a$  (Masle *et al.*, 1993). Had perfect acclimation occurred, Rubisco would be equally limiting at both  $pC_a$  and the relative effect of the reduction in content would be about the same. Furthermore, sample  $A-pC_i$  responses again showed only a small shift in favour of RuBP-regeneration over carboxylation capacity in wild-type leaves (Masle et al., 1993).

In recent work (Theobald et al., 1998), gas-exchange and leaf composition measurements were used to estimate the amount of excess Rubisco at elevated  $pC_a$  in flag-2, flag-1 and flag leaves of wheat grown at different  $pC_a$  and N supply regimes. Most of the excess Rubisco at high  $pC_a$  persisted even in plants grown at high  $pC_a$ . It was also concluded that what decrease in excess there was in these plants occurred probably as a consequence of elevated growth  $pC_a$  inducing a reduction in leaf N content, which was strongly associated with a decrease in the fraction of Rubisco that was in excess. Here, the gasexchange measurements are re-examined specifically to estimate the value of RuBP regeneration capacity and the effects of growth  $pC_a$  and N on the balance between RuBP-regeneration and carboxylation capacities in wheat. This new analysis has somewhat modified one of the original conclusions.

In order to interpret how these results compare with theoretical optima, it is necessary to remember that photosynthetic components are often not optimized such as to maximize photosynthesis for (unnatural) constant conditions, but rather appear to invest such that they can exploit changes that would be expected in a natural environment (Stitt and Schulze, 1994). In the case of the balance between carboxylation and RuBP-regeneration capacities, the optimum is affected by temperature and PPFD, which fluctuate too rapidly to be acclimated to in a natural environment. A model was therefore developed which describes the balance of carboxylation and RuBP- regeneration capacities as a function of  $pC_a$ , temperature and PPFD. This model allows the investigation of how the optimal balance of capacities under the measuring conditions of light-saturation and 20 °C will differ from the optimal balance for a natural environment.

#### Materials and methods

#### Experimental

The experimental methods have been described in detail (Theobald *et al.*, 1998), but a brief summary is given here. Spring wheat stands were grown from emergence to maturity at 600 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> PPFD, day/night temperature 20/12 °C, and vapour-pressure deficit 0.8/0.4 kPa VPD. They were grown either under ambient (36 Pa) or elevated (70 Pa) CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressures and with low or high N supply. Response of light-saturated photosynthesis to internal CO<sub>2</sub> partial pressure ( $pC_i$ ) was measured at intervals in flag-2, flag-1 and flag leaves. The same leaves were sampled to determine leaf N, Rubisco and ATP-synthase contents, and Rubisco activation state.

Carboxylation capacity ( $V_{\rm cmax}$ ) was estimated from fitting points below a critical  $pC_i$  (as detailed in Theobald *et al.*, 1998). RuBP-regeneration capacity ( $J_{\rm max}$ ) was estimated from fitting points above critical  $pC_i$  to the equation (Farquhar and Sharkey, 1994):

$$A_{g} = J_{\max}(pC_{c} - \Gamma_{*})/(4pC_{c} + 8\Gamma_{*})$$
(1)

where  $A_g$  is photosynthetic rate gross of dark respiration,  $\Gamma_*$  is photorespiratory compensation point and

$$pC_{c} = pC_{i} - A/g_{w}$$
(2)

where  $g_w$  is the transfer conductance from the intercellular space to the site of carboxylation. The critical  $pC_i$  was chosen by trying each value in the range 25–35 Pa with 1 Pa steps and finding the value that maximized the overall percentage variance accounted for when the two curves were fitted below and above this point. Points at high  $pC_i$  (>60 Pa) which showed signs of limitation by capacity to utilise triose-phosphate (i.e. decreased *A* with increasing  $pC_i$ ) were excluded from the fit to Equation 1.

A further parameter was derived from estimates of  $J_{\text{max}}$  and  $V_{\text{cmax}}$ . The  $pC_c$  at which the two capacities are equal  $(pC_{c,\text{bal}})$  is given by:

$$pC_{c,bal} = (J_{max}K - 8V_{cmax}\Gamma_*)/(4V_{cmax} - J_{max})$$
(3)

where K is the effective Michaelis-Menten constant of Rubisco for  $pC_c$ .  $pC_{c,bal}$  is converted to the corresponding  $pC_a$  ( $pC_{a,bal}$ ) by adding  $A/g_w$  and multiplying by observed  $pC_a/pC_i$  ratio (which was not affected by growth  $pC_a$ ).

#### Modelling

The same parameter values used in the fitting procedure were used in the model (Table 1). Additional parameters assumed were necessary to treat the temperature dependence of these parameters, and to investigate the effect of variable PPFD. This latter effect was treated by using the solution to the equation (Farquhar and Sharkey, 1994):

$$\theta J^2 - J(\alpha I/2 + J_{\text{max}}) + \alpha I/2J_{\text{max}} = 0$$
 (4)

where  $\theta$  is the curvature of the response,  $\alpha$  is the fraction of incident light usefully absorbed by PSII and *I* is the PPFD of incident light. For model runs shown here, a light distribution was chosen with a range of 100–1500 mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> with the duration of each being the same for 100–600 µmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>,

Estimated values are taken from literature for wheat, where possible.

Parameter	Units	Value at 20 °C	Temperature dependency
$K_{\rm c}$ Rubisco Michaelis constant for CO <sub>2</sub>	μΜ	$10.1^{b}$	2% of 25 °C value increase per °C <sup>c</sup>
$K_{o}$ Rubisco Michaelis constant for O <sub>2</sub>	μΜ	383 <sup>b</sup>	None <sup>d</sup>
τ Rubisco specificity factor		116 <sup>e</sup>	2.9% of 25 °C value decrease per °C <sup><math>e</math></sup>
$\Gamma_*$	Pa	$3.2^{a,f}$	From that for $\tau$ and solubilities <sup>f</sup>
Κ	Pa	$46^{a,g}$	From that for $K_c$ , $K_o$ and solubilities <sup>g</sup>
$q_{w}$	$\mu$ mol m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> Pa <sup>-1</sup>	$5.0 - 2.0^{a,h}$	None
V <sub>cmax</sub>	$\mu$ mol m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup>	$100^{i}$	$E_a = 58600 \text{ J mol}^{-1b}$
J <sub>max</sub>	$\mu$ mol m <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup>	$178^{i}$	$E_a = 37000 \text{ J mol}^{-1j}$
α		$0.65^{k}$	None
$\beta p C_i / p C_a$ ratio		$0.7^{k}$	None
θ		$0.7 – 0.98^{k}$	None
N <sub>RC</sub>		$2.0^{l}$	None

"Values used in fitting procedure.

<sup>b</sup>Makino et al. (1988).

<sup>c</sup>Machler et al. (1980)

<sup>d</sup>Jordan and Ogren (1984).

<sup>e</sup>Keys (1999).

<sup>*f*</sup> Derived from  $\tau$  and temperature dependent solubilities of O<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> in water (Ku and Edwards, 1977).

<sup>g</sup>Derived from  $K_c$  and  $K_o$  and temperature dependent solubilities of  $O_2$  and  $CO_2$  in water (Ku and Edwards, 1977).

<sup>h</sup>Loreto *et al.*, (1994). Value set to 5  $\mu$ mol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> Pa<sup>-1</sup> in model.

<sup>*i*</sup>Typical values observed for young leaves.

<sup>*j*</sup>Farquhar *et al.* (1980).

<sup>k</sup>Medlyn (1996).

<sup>1</sup> See text.

and then decreasing linearly to 10% of this at 1500  $\mu mol \; m^{-2} \; s^{-1}.$ 

For modelling of optimal balance it is also necessary to assume a relative N cost for  $J_{\text{max}}$  compared to that for  $V_{\text{cmax}}$  ( $N_{\text{RC}}$ ). If  $J_{\text{max}}$  can only be increased by increasing the number of photosynthetic cells and chloroplasts per unit leaf area then  $N_{\text{RC}} \approx 2$  (Table 1).

#### Results

Figure 1 shows the relationship between  $J_{\text{max}}$  estimated from gas exchange and the ATP-synthase content of the same leaf section, estimated by Western blots (Theobald *et al.*, 1998). The data are reasonably well correlated  $(R^2=0.65)$ , although not as tightly as Rubisco content and  $V_{\text{cmax}}$  (Theobald *et al.*, 1998).

Changes of  $J_{\text{max}}$  in flag leaves through time (Fig. 2) showed that low N supply generally decreased  $J_{\text{max}}$ , and that elevated growth  $pC_a$  never significantly increased  $J_{\text{max}}$  and sometimes induced a decrease. Also shown in Fig. 2 is the balance of carboxylation and RuBP-regeneration capacities, expressed as the  $pC_a$  at which they would be equal ( $pC_{a,bal}$  calculated from  $V_{\text{cmax}}$  and  $J_{\text{max}}$  values using equation 3). Optimal use of resources for the measurement conditions is therefore given by  $pC_{a,bal} = \text{growth } pC_a$  (i.e. 36 or 70 Pa). In plants grown with  $pC_a = 36$  Pa, the value of  $pC_{a,bal}$  is initially above 36 Pa and



**Fig. 1.**  $J_{\text{max}}$  against ATP-synthase content in wheat flag-1 and flag leaves for different growth conditions. Line shows regression  $y = 476 \times (R^2 = 0.65)$ . (Data from Theobald *et al.*, 1998, with a recalculated *y*-axis.) (○) Low N, 36 Pa CO<sub>2</sub>; (●) low N, 70 Pa CO<sub>2</sub>; (□) high N, 36Pa CO<sub>2</sub>; ■ high N, 70 Pa CO<sub>2</sub>.

tends to decrease with time (especially with high N supply), indicating increased limitation by RuBP-regeneration. Growth at 70 Pa  $pC_a$  had no significant effect on  $pC_{a,bal}$  values in flag leaves at full emergence (first point), and there was no consistent effect for any point for high N plants. However, growth at 70 Pa  $pC_a$  did significantly increase  $pC_{a,bal}$  values to 55–60 Pa for low N plants in the period 9–16 d after anthesis.



**Fig. 2.** Changes in  $J_{\text{max}}$  and  $pC_{a,\text{bal}}$  through time for flag leaves grown under different conditions as indicated in the key. Each point is mean of parameter estimates from six separate  $A_{-}pC_i$  responses. Error bars are SED. (○) Low N, 36 Pa CO<sub>2</sub>; (●) low N, 70 Pa CO<sub>2</sub>; (□) high N, 36Pa CO<sub>2</sub>; ■ high N, 70 Pa CO<sub>2</sub>.

This rebalancing could be explained as a reduction in leaf N content, which is generally associated with a decrease in carboxylation capacity relative to RuBPregeneration capacity in our data (Theobald et al., 1998). Figure 3 shows the data from the first four occasions in Fig. 2 replotted against leaf N content for individual leaf segments.  $J_{max}$  is significantly, but not very tightly, correlated with leaf N content ( $R^2 = 0.38$ ), and there are no significant differences between growth environments in the relationship. However, the relationship between  $pC_{a,bal}$  and leaf N was significantly improved by assuming separate intercepts and slopes for plants grown in the two  $pC_a$  environments ( $R^2 = 0.53$ ). These lines suggest that growth at elevated  $pC_a$  induces a rebalancing in favour of RuBP-regeneration capacity for leaves with low N content (<1.5  $g m^{-2}$ ) in addition to any effect on leaf N content.

The results of running the model to find the optimal value of relative investment in components responsible for RuBP-regeneration and carboxylation for variable environments are shown in Figs 4 and 5, and are expressed as the  $pC_{a,bal}$  that would be observed at 20 °C and saturating light. The more curved the light-response of photosynthesis (i.e. the lower the value of  $\theta$ ), the greater the value of  $pC_{a,bal}$  (Fig. 4). As  $\theta$  approaches 1, where there is no co-limitation, the optimal value approaches the growth  $pC_a$ . It is interesting to note that the observed values of  $pC_{a,bal}$  from this study are consistent with



**Fig. 3.** Leaf N content versus  $J_{\text{max}}$  and  $pC_{a,\text{bal}}$  for flag leaves grown under different conditions for the first four measuring times in Fig. 2 (8 samples lost, so n=88). Relationship as tested by linear regression is not significantly different between growth  $pC_a$  for  $J_{\text{max}}$  ( $R^2=0.39$ ), but slopes differ significantly for  $pC_{a,\text{bal}}$  (-13 for 36 Pa, -32 for 70 Pa;  $R^2=0.54$ ).



**Fig. 4.** Model output predicting the optimal balance between RuBPregeneration and carboxylation capacities ( $pC_{a,bal}$  measured at saturating light) for different curvature of light response and a distribution of growth PPFD values.

optimization to the pre-industrial  $pC_a$  for reasonable values of  $\theta$  (~0.85). Figure 5 shows the effect of a difference in leaf temperature between growth and measurement conditions. The measured  $pC_{a,bal}$  will tend to exceed the growth  $pC_a$  if it is optimized to a lower temperature than the measurement temperature, and vice versa.

## Discussion

Assuming ATP-synthase is substrate-saturated and fully activated under conditions where RuBP-regeneration



**Fig. 5.** Model output predicting the optimal balance between RuBPregeneration and carboxylation capacities ( $pC_{a,bal}$  measured at 20 °C) for different growth temperatures assuming saturating PPFD.

limits photosynthesis, it is possible to estimate a  $k_{cat}$  from the regression line through the origin in Fig. 1. A value of 260 mol ATP mol<sup>-1</sup> ATP-synthase s<sup>-1</sup>, is given by assuming 1 ATP:3 protons:1 electron. However, these assumptions give a higher value than the ATP-requirement for the observed photosynthetic rates in the range where RuBP-regeneration is assumed limiting, i.e. the points used to estimate  $J_{max}$  (data not shown). This is because equation 1, used to estimate  $J_{max}$ , assumes limitation of photosynthesis by production of reductant rather than ATP. The two estimates match closely if 1 ATP:4 protons and 3 protons:1 electron are assumed (Noctor and Foyer, 2000), giving a  $k_{cat}$  of 200 mol ATP mol<sup>-1</sup> ATP-synthase s<sup>-1</sup>.

The reanalysis of the gas-exchange data (396  $A-pC_i$ ) responses) from previously reported experiments (Theobald et al., 1998) is consistent with the main conclusions arrived at there: that there is a tendency to overinvest in Rubisco for optimization of photosynthesis to growth at 70 Pa  $pC_a$  (shown by  $pC_{a,bal} < 70$  Pa in Fig. 2), and that this tendency is much greater in leaves with high N contents (Fig. 3). When elevated  $pC_a$  does induce an apparent rebalancing, it is by a reduction in Rubisco content, rather than a stimulation of RuBP-regeneration components, since  $J_{max}$  was never increased by growth at elevated  $pC_a$  (Fig. 2), and it appears to occur only in older leaves with low N supply. However, while it was concluded (Theobald et al., 1998) that this rebalancing was entirely explicable as a consequence of elevated  $pC_a$ reducing leaf N content, specific analysis of the relationship between RuBP-regeneration and carboxylation capacities suggests that RuBP-regeneration: carboxylation is increased by growth at elevated  $pC_a$  for a given leaf N content (Fig. 3).

Recent studies on response of photosynthetic capacities to elevated  $pC_a$  have confirmed the conclusions from a review of earlier studies (Sage, 1994), that the response is variable and more likely to occur when N is deficient. In field experiments on wheat, it was found that Rubisco decreased more in response to elevated  $pC_a$  in plants grown with limiting N supply than with free access to N (Rogers et al., 1996) and no evidence was found of a decrease in photosynthetic capacity of young, fullyexpanded leaves until grain-fill in a well-fertilized crop (Garcia et al., 1998), although there was some evidence for a decrease in Rubisco in leaves lower in the canopy (Osborne et al., 1998). This latter study also found increased amounts of light-harvesting complex in these leaves, but this is consistent with acclimation to low incident radiation and would not be expected to increase  $J_{\text{max}}$ . In a controlled-environment experiment on wheat, it has been shown that changes in photosynthetic capacity at elevated  $pC_a$  were completely eliminated by supplying N in proportion to growth, thus removing the indirect effect of  $pC_a$  in increasing the limitation of N on growth (Farage et al., 1998). In a study which looked specifically at the ratio of RuBP-regeneration capacity: carboxylation capacity in soybean (Sims et al., 1998a), growth at elevated  $pC_a$  increased the ratio more in plants grown at low N than at high N. However, they found that low N supply alone did not affect, or even increased this ratio. This contrasts with the results of the present study for wheat, where low N supply increased pCa,bal (Fig. 2), equivalent to a decrease in the ratio, a finding which is consistent with the observation that the ratio of Rubisco: ATP-synthase contents increases in wheat leaves with high N contents (Theobald et al., 1998).

It is interesting to speculate on the mechanism behind the shift in balance between RuBP-regeneration and carboxylation capacities that sometimes occurs in response to elevated  $pC_a$ . It now seems clear that it is not a direct response to  $pC_a$ , but rather a consequence of the change in the balance of limitations for plant growth which occurs at elevated pCa (Farage et al., 1998; Sage, 1994; Sims et al., 1998b). It is often suggested that sugar accumulation in the leaf, which suppresses expression of photosynthetic genes, may be the cause (van Oosten and Besford, 1996), but this also decreases expression of genes encoding components of RuBP-regeneration (Krapp and Stitt, 1995). It may be that the amount of active Rubisco responds more quickly than other components, but this has not been established. In the later leaves of wheat, this mechanism seems less likely as fructan synthesis in the internodes represent a very large sink for sugar export. Leaf carbohydrate content was not increased at elevated  $pC_a$  in the experiments (JC Theobald, unpublished data) and was not correlated with changes in message levels for photosynthetic components in a field experiment on wheat (Nie et al., 1995). The timing of the effect seems more consistent with an increased demand for N from an increased number of grain at elevated  $pC_a$ , an interpretation that also applied to a number of open-topped chamber experiments carried out in Europe (Mitchell et al., 1999).

In this paper, the balance of RuBP-regeneration: carboxylation capacities has been presented as  $pC_{a,bal}$ , which allows comparison with the growth environment  $pC_a$ . However,  $pC_a = pC_{a,bal}$  does not correspond to optimal use of resources for the growth environment where incident radiation fluctuates, because  $J_{max}$  is believed to have an influence on photosynthesis at sub-saturating light intensities (Farquhar et al., 1980). It has been shown that this increases the optimal ratio of  $J_{\text{max}}$ :  $V_{\text{cmax}}$ , depending on the curvature in equation 4 and the light distribution that is assumed (Medlyn, 1996). An arbitrary light distribution was chosen in this work, which has the necessary property that the duration of intensities approaching full sunlight are shorter than those for lower intensities; other distributions with this property gave similar results. In this case, the curvature  $(\theta)$  reflects genuine co-limitation between  $J_{\text{max}}$  and PPFD, rather than any heterogeneity within the leaf. The model shows (Fig. 4) that the observation that  $pC_{a,bal}$  usually exceeds the current ambient  $pC_a$ (in young leaves  $pC_{a,bal} \approx 40$  Pa in these data, Fig. 2), in agreement with results elsewhere (Makino et al., 1988; Masle et al., 1993; von Caemmerer et al., 1994), could be consistent with optimization. Indeed, it could even be consistent with adaptation to the pre-industrial  $pC_a$ (Fig. 4).

The model was also used to examine the effect of temperature on the optimal balance of capacities. The specific temperature dependencies in Table 1 are open to some doubt, since published data are sparse, and for  $K_c$  and  $K_o$  a temperature dependency for spinach was used to correct the published wheat value determined at 25 °C. Nevertheless, it seems certain that  $J_{max}$  is less increased by temperature than  $V_{cmax}$ , for example, in cotton (Harley *et al.*, 1992). This has the consequence that if leaves optimize their resources to a lower average temperature than they are measured at, the observed  $pC_{a,bal}$  will be greater than the growth  $pC_a$  (Fig. 5).

For an optimal resource allocation between RuBPregeneration and carboxylation capacities at a growth  $pC_a$  of 70 Pa, the  $pC_{a,bal}$  should exceed this value, as shown in Fig. 4. This was not observed in these data (Fig. 3). The only occasions on which partial rebalancing did occur in response to elevated growth  $pC_a$ , were between 6 d and 15 d after anthesis in the low N treatment (Fig. 3), possibly corresponding to large N demand from the developing grain. It therefore appears that there is a tendency for wheat to over-invest in Rubisco at elevated  $pC_a$ , so genetic manipulation to reduce Rubisco relative to RuBP-regeneration capacity could benefit N-use efficiency of photosynthesis under these conditions.

## Acknowledgements

Gift of antibodies against CF1 sub-units from Professor JC Gray, University of Cambridge, UK is gratefully acknowledged.

We thank Dr PJ Andralojc for assistance and advice with the ATP-synthase work, and SP Driscoll and VJ Mitchell for technical assistance. We thank Professors CB Osmond and SP Long for useful comments on the manuscript. JCT was supported by a grant from the European Union as part of the ESPACE-Wheat project, contract number EV5V-C793–0301. RACM receives support from UK Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food contract CSA4532. IACR-Rothamsted receives grant-aided support from the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council of the United Kingdom.

#### References

- Barnola JM, Raynaud D, Korotkevich YS, Lorius C. 1987. Vostok ice core provides 160 000-year record of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. *Nature* **329**, 408–414.
- Farage PK, McKee IF, Long SP. 1998. Does a low nitrogen supply necessarily lead to acclimation of photosynthesis to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>? *Plant Physiology* **118**, 573–580.
- Farquhar GD, Sharkey TD. 1994. Phototsynthesis and carbon assimilation. In: KJ Boote, JM Bennett, TR Sinclair, GM Paulson, eds. *Physiology and determination of crop yield*. Madison, USA: American Society of Agronomy, 187–210.
- Farquhar GD, von Caemmerer S, Berry JA. 1980. A biochemical model of photosynthetic  $CO_2$  assimilation in leaves of  $C_3$  species. *Planta* **149**, 78–90.
- Fischer RA, Rees D, Sayre KD, Lu ZM, Condon AG, Saavedra AL. 1998. Wheat yield progress associated with higher stomatal conductance and photosynthetic rate, and cooler canopies. *Crop Science* **38**, 1467–1475.
- Garcia RL, Long SP, Wall GW, Osborne CP, Kimball BA, Nie GY, Pinter PJ, Lamorte RL, Wechsung F. 1998. Photosynthesis and conductance of spring-wheat leaves: field response to continuous free-air atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **21**, 659–669.
- Harley PC, Thomas RB, Reynolds JF, Strain BR. 1992. Modelling photosynthesis of cotton grown in elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **15**, 271–282.
- **Jordan DB, Ogren WL.** 1984. The CO<sub>2</sub>/O<sub>2</sub> specificity of ribulose 1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase—dependence on ribulose bisphosphate concentration, pH and temperature. *Planta* **161**, 308–313.
- Keys AJ. 1999. Biochemistry of photorespiration and the consequences for plant performance. In: M Burrell, J Bryant, N Kruger, eds. *Plant carbohydrate biochemistry*. Oxford, UK: BIOS Scientific Publishers Ltd. (in press)
- Krapp A, Stitt M. 1995. An evaluation of direct and indirect mechanisms for the sink-regulation of photosynthesis in spinach—changes in gas-exchange, carbohydrates, metabolites, enzyme-activities and steady-state transcript levels after cold-girdling source leaves. *Planta* 195, 313–323.
- **Ku SB, Edwards GE.** 1977. Oxygen inhibition of photosynthesis. I. Temperature dependence and realtion to O<sub>2</sub>/CO<sub>2</sub> solubility ratio. *Plant Physiology* **59**, 986–990.
- Loreto F, Dimarco G, Tricoli D, Sharkey TD. 1994. Measurements of mesophyll conductance, photosynthetic electron-transport and alternative electron sinks of fieldgrown wheat leaves. *Photosynthesis Research* **41**, 397–403.
- Machler F, Keys AJ, Cornelius MJ. 1980. Activation of ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase purified from wheat leaves. *Journal* of Experimental Botany 31, 7–14.
- Makino A, Mae T, Ohira K. 1988. Differences between wheat and rice in the enzymic properties of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase and the relationship to photosynthetic gas-exchange. *Planta* **174**, 30–38.

- Makino A, Shimada T, Takumi S, Kaneko K, Matsuoka M, Shimamoto K, Nakano H, Miyao-Tokutomi M, Mae T, Yamamoto N. 1997. Does decrease in ribulose-1,5,-bisphosphate carboxylase by 'antisense' RbcS lead to a higher nitrogenuse efficiency of photosynthesis under conditions of saturating CO<sub>2</sub> and light in rice plants? *Plant Physiology* **114**, 483–491.
- Masle J, Hudson GS, Badger MR. 1993. Effects of ambient  $CO_2$  concentration on growth and nitrogen use in tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*) plants transformed with an antisense gene to the small-subunit of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase. *Plant Physiology* **103**, 1075–1088.
- Medlyn BE. 1996. The optimal allocation of nitrogen within the  $C_3$  photosynthetic system at elevated  $CO_2$ . Australian Journal of Plant Physiology 23, 593–603.
- Mitchell RAC, Black CR, Burkart S, Burke JI, Donnelly A, de Temmerman L, Fangmeier A, Mulholland BJ, Theobald JC, van Oijen M. 1999. Photosynthetic responses in spring wheat grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and stress conditions in the European, multiple-site experiment 'ESPACEwheat' European Journal of Agronomy 10, 205–214.
- Nie GY, Hendrix DL, Webber AN, Kimball BA, Long SP. 1995. Increased accumulation of carbohydrates and decreased photosynthetic gene transcript levels in wheat grown at an elevated  $CO_2$  concentration in the field. *Plant Physiology* **108**, 975–983.
- **Noctor G, Foyer CH.** 2000. Homeostasis of adenylate status during photosynthesis in a fluctuating environment. *Journal of Experimental Botany* **51**, 000–000.
- Osborne CP, LaRoche J, Garcia RL, Kimball BA, Wall GW, Pinter PJ, LaMorte RL, Hendrey GR, Long SP. 1998. Does leaf position within a canopy affect acclimation of photosynthesis to elevated CO<sub>2</sub>? Analysis of a wheat crop under freeair CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment. *Plant Physiology* **117**, 1037–1045.
- Quick WP, Fichtner K, Schulze ED, Wendler R, Leegood RC, Mooney H, Rodermel SR, Bogorad L, Stitt M. 1992.

Decreased ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase-oxygenase in transgenic tobacco transformed with antisense Rbcs. 4. Impact on photosynthesis in conditions of altered nitrogen supply. *Planta* **188**, 522–531.

- **Rogers GS, Milham PJ, Gillings M, Conroy JP.** 1996. Sink strength may be the key to growth and nitrogen responses in N-deficient wheat at elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology* **23**, 253–264.
- Sage RF. 1994. Acclimation of photosynthesis to increasing atmospheric  $CO_2$ —the gas-exchange perspective. *Photosynthesis Research* **39**, 351–368.
- Sims DA, Luo Y, Seemann JR. 1998*a*. Comparison of photosynthetic acclimation to elevated  $CO_2$  and limited nitrogen supply in soybean. *Plant, Cell and Environment* 21, 945–952.
- Sims DA, Luo Y, Seemann JR. 1998b. Importance of leaf versus whole plant CO<sub>2</sub> environment for photosynthetic acclimation. *Plant, Cell and Environment* **21**, 1189–1196.
- Stitt M, Schulze E-D. 1994. Plant growth, storage, and resource allocation: from flux control in a metabolic chain to the whole-plant level. In: Schulze E-D, ed. *Flux control in biological systems*. San Diego, USA: Academic Press Inc., 57–118.
- **Theobald JC, Mitchell RAC, Parry MAJ, Lawlor DW.** 1998. Estimating the excess investment in ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase in leaves of spring wheat grown under elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant Physiology* **118**, 945–955.
- van Oosten JJ, Besford RT. 1996. Acclimation of photosynthesis to elevated CO<sub>2</sub> through feedback-regulation of gene-expression—climate of opinion. *Photosynthesis Research* 48, 353–365.
- von Caemmerer S, Evans JR, Hudson GS, Andrews TJ. 1994. The kinetics of ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/ oxygenase *in vivo* inferred from measurements of photosynthesis in leaves of transgenic tobacco. *Planta* **195**, 88–97.