1	Responses of soil clay mineralogy in the Rothamsted Classical Experiments in relation to
2	management practice and changing land use
3	<sup>1</sup> A.M. Tye, <sup>1</sup> S.J. Kemp and <sup>2</sup> P.R. Poulton.
4	
5	<sup>1</sup> British Geological Survey, Keyworth, Nottingham, NG12 5GG, U.K.
6	<sup>2</sup> Department of Soil Science, Rothamsted Research, Harpenden, AL5 2JQ, U.K.
7	
8	
9	Abstract
10	Changes in the clay mineralogy of soil samples collected from the Rothamsted Classical
11	Experiments over the past ~150 years were examined. Comparisons were undertaken to assess
12	the impact of (i) different fertiliser practices on the top soil and sub soil of the Park Grass
13	Experiment and (ii) the effects of changing land-use from agriculture to woodland where soil
14	pH either remained close to pH 7 or became acid. Analyses were undertaken on the ${<}0.2~\mu\text{m}$
15	clay fraction and measurements included cation exchange capacity (CEC), surface area and
16	X-ray diffraction (XRD). The fine clay fraction of all the samples is composed of
17	illite/smectite (I/S), illite and kaolinite minerals. Decomposition modelling of XRD spectra
18	identified three I/S phases including (i) a high smectite I/S phase ( $d(00l) \sim 15$ Å), (ii) a low
19	smectite I/S phase ( $d(00l) \sim 12.5$ Å) and (iii) an illite phase ( $d(00l) \sim 11.2$ Å). The I/S phase is
20	typically made up of ~60 % of high smectite I/S, ~20 % low smectite I/S and ~20 % illite.
21	Attempts to account for changes in clay CEC and surface area with time proved to be

Attempts to account for changes in chay CEC and sufface area with time proved to be inconclusive, possibly because of the differing proportions of the three I/S phases in each sample. Some temporal changes in the d(001) spacing of I/S mineral phases from the decomposed XRD spectra (>0.4 Å) are reported in both top soil (0-23 cm) and sub soil (46-69 cm) and are likely related to (i) changes in soil K<sup>+</sup> or NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> status and/or (iii) increasing soil acidity. The greatest change was found in the Park Grass Experiment (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> plot where 27 soil pH fell below 3.7. It is believed that solubilisation of hydroxyl-Al in smectite interlayers enabled renewed access to  $K^+$  or  $NH_4^+$  ions, leading to increased collapse in *d001* spacing. 28 However, the results show that over a diverse range of soil conditions, I/S minerals of the 29 30 Batcombe series soils showed considerable resilience to major change. This is considered to be a result of competition for sorption sites by the (i) presence of competing ions added as 31 fertiliser or liming materials, (ii) an increase in H<sup>+</sup> ions as soil acidity increases, (iii) the 32 possible role of organic carbon in protecting I/S minerals and (iv) the role of the I/S minerals 33 as K<sup>+</sup> reservoirs. However, the impact of decreasing soil pH should be considered when land 34 35 is re-forested as this may lead to irreversible decreases in the d(00l) spacing of I/S minerals, thus compromising useful clay properties such as CEC. 36

37

Keywords: Clay minerals, Soils, Illite/Smectite, X-ray diffraction, Land management
 39

#### 40 1. Introduction

41 Clay mineral properties are fundamental to many soil functions including water and nutrient retention, contaminant (pesticides, heavy metals) attenuation, carbon storage, the maintenance 42 of soil structure and the filtering of both ground and surface waters. However, relatively few 43 studies have been undertaken to examine how clay mineral structure may change with (i) the 44 45 inorganic chemical inputs of intensive agricultural systems and (ii) land use changes over long 46 periods of time. Thus, soil archives from long-term experiments provide a valuable resource, allowing changes to be studied with knowledge of management practices over relatively long 47 periods (Velde & Peck, 2002). In addition, recent advances in X-ray diffraction (XRD) 48 techniques such as decomposition modelling have allowed greater interpretation of XRD 49 profiles, enabling more precise identification of different soil clay mineral phases (e.g. Mathé 50 et al., 2007; Egli et al., 2007). In this study we assess changes in clay mineral structure from 51

the 'Rothamsted Classical Experiments' (Johnston, 1997) in relation to fertiliser additions and
 changing land use.

54

55 In temperate regions, attention has largely focused on 2:1 clay minerals (smectite, vermiculite, illite, chlorite and their intergrades) as they dominate the clay mineralogy of many soils (Velde, 56 2001). With respect to fertiliser applications, work has largely focussed on the interactions 57 between K<sup>+</sup> and illite/smectite (I/S) mixed layer minerals (Singh & Goulding, 1997; Velde & 58 Peck, 2002; Pernes-Debuyser et al. 2003; Mathé et al., 2007; Barré et al. 2007a & b). These 59 studies have shown the importance of K<sup>+</sup> in determining the nature of I/S minerals and the K<sup>+</sup> 60 buffer capacity for plant nutrition. For example, Velde & Peck (2002) examined samples taken 61 62 between 1913 and 1996 from the Morrow Plot Experiment archive at the University of Illinois. The major finding was that under continuous corn cropping and without fertilisation, the 63 extraction of K<sup>+</sup> for plant nutrition led to an increase in the smectite content of I/S minerals. 64 Pernes-Debuyser et al. (2003) demonstrated that in soils where plant growth was absent, the 65 addition of K<sup>+</sup> fertiliser resulted in an increase in the illite (non-expandable) content of the I/S. 66 These results, among others, led Barré et al. (2007a & b) to postulate that 'illite-like layers' can 67 be viewed as K<sup>+</sup> reservoirs that can be potentially refuelled via the 'nutrient uplift theory' 68 suggested by Jobbagy & Jackson (2001). Therefore, in top soils where greater  $K^+$  is uplifted or 69 recycled than is required by plants the system could be pushed towards the illite end of the I/S 70 system. Changes in clay mineralogy have also been investigated in chronosequences under 71 natural conditions where the role of  $K^+$  has been important in determining changes in I/S 72 mineral structure. Velde et al. (2003) examined changes in poldered sediments under natural 73 pasture development. In the oldest profiles (>800 yrs), a disordered illitic I/S mineral became 74 dominant in the upper parts of the profile whilst in the lower part of the profile a smectitic I/S 75 mineral was predominant. Mathé et al. (2007) monitored soil clay minerals from recent natural 76

polders in response to local environmental conditions and noted that with increasing age, chlorite was removed and the illite content of I/S increased. Such reactions were triggered by oxidation and in natural systems would last >1000 y but could be accelerated by artificial drainage to complete the process in a few tens of years.

81

Less work has been undertaken on the role of inorganic N fertilisers on clay mineralogy despite 82 this representing the major input of chemical elements and acidity to intensive agricultural 83 systems. The biogeochemistry of N amendments depends on the form applied. Both NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and 84  $NH_4^+$  applications can affect the reduction of structural Fe<sup>3+</sup> to Fe<sup>2+</sup> in clays, a process essential 85 to the collapse of interlayers in smectitic minerals (Stuki, 1997). For example, in waterlogged 86 soils the presence of  $NO_3^-$  has been found to inhibit the reduction of structural  $Fe^{3+}$  to  $Fe^{2+}$ 87 (Chen et al., 2008; Matocha & Coyne, 2005), but its effect was found to be temporary, lasting 88 as long as sufficient NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> was available. The application of ammonium fertilisers has been 89 found to increase Fe(III) reduction, probably through coupled  $NH_4^+$  oxidation (Chen *et al.* 90 2008). The majority of this work has examined changes in the top-soil and relatively little is 91 known regarding changes in clay mineralogy in sub soils and how they react to agricultural 92 practice. However, understanding how they change with respect to time and land management 93 is important because of the role they play in the filtration and attenuation of contaminants for 94 surface and groundwater. 95

96

A second area of land management where changes in the structure of clay minerals may be induced is where soils have undergone acidification either through natural or man-induced processes. There has generally been a greater emphasis on using chemical, rather than mineralogical measurements in these studies to demonstrate changes in clay function. The effects of the addition of ammonium fertilisers has been studied by Barak *et al.* (1997) and

McGahan *et al.* (2003), whilst Blake *et al.* (1999) examined the effects of natural acidification as agricultural land has reverted to woodland in the Geescroft Classical Experiment at Rothamsted. The formation of interlayer hydroxyl-aluminium was found to be important in the buffering process against acidification and can lead to a loss in clay cation exchange capacity (Ulrich, 1991).

This study aims to identify changes in clay mineral structure in soils from the archive of the 108 109 Rothamsted Classical Experiments that extend over ~150 years. Limited analyses of clay 110 mineralogy in some of these soils, has been undertaken as part of projects where greater focus was placed on chemical measurements (Blake et al., 1999; Singh & Goulding, 1997). This 111 112 work undertakes a more systematic examination of archive samples from the Park Grass 113 Experiment and the Broadbalk and Geescroft Wildernesses using decomposition modelling of XRD profiles to identify changes in clay mineralogy that have accompanied some of the 114 previously reported chemical changes (e.g. Blake et al., 1999). The changes found in clay 115 116 structure after (i) long-term and repeated application of N and K fertilisers and (ii) natural (reforestation) and fertiliser induced acidification in the top and sub soil are reported. 117

118

#### 119 **2. Materials and Methods**

## 120 2.1 Background and Sample Collection

Samples used in this study were taken from three of the Rothamsted Classical Experiments;
Park Grass, Geescroft Wilderness, and Broadbalk Wilderness. Soils from all the experiments
are representative of the Batcombe series or close variants. These are classified by the Soil
Classification for England and Wales as stagnogleyic palaeo-argillic brown earths (Avery,
1980) or Aquic Paleudalf (U.S.D.A, 1992). The top soil is silty clay loam forming on
Quaternary Clay-with-Flints deposits that can lie several metres deep over the Chalk bedrock.

<sup>107</sup> 

127 Clay-with-Flints deposits were most likely derived from the Reading Formation (Lambeth Group) and developed during warm periods between plateau drift and the Chalk bedrock 128 through clay particles and insoluble chalk residues infiltrating dissolution hollows in the Chalk. 129 130 During cold periods, cryoturbation possibly remixed this accumulation with the plateau drift (Catt & Hodgson, 1976). The mineralogy of the sand fraction of the Batcombe series soils 131 found at Rothamsted is similar to that of the Reading Beds (Catt & Hodgson, 1976). Reading 132 Formation clay mineral assemblages are illite-dominated, with minor smectite, kaolin and 133 chlorite although altered ash, comprising smectite-dominated horizons are also found (Huggett 134 135 & Knox, 2006).

136

Soil samples (up to 1999) were collected with an open ended steel box (internal dimensions 15 137 x 15 x 23 cm deep). This was driven into the ground until it was flush with the surface; the soil 138 139 was then dug out (Poulton et al., 2003). Either 3, 4 or 6 holes were taken for a composite sample from each treatment. However, one of the Park Grass Experiment samples (Plot 3, 140 Unlimed, 1966) was taken as a single 15 x 15 x 23 cm sample. Samples were sieved to <2 mm, 141 142 air-dried and stored in sealed glass jars within the Rothamsted Sample Archive. After 1999, soils were sampled by taking cores with semi-cylindrical augers. Blake et al. (2000) examined 143 changes in properties of the soils maintained in the soil archive and found only minor changes 144 in exchangeable K<sup>+</sup> between 1959 and 1991. 145

146

#### 147 **2.2 Comparisons undertaken**

#### 148 **2.2.1 Fertiliser effects on top and sub soils using Park Grass samples**

The Park Grass Experiment was started in 1856 on a site which had been in permanent grassland for at least 100 years. The soil was slightly acid ( $pH_{(H2O)}$  5.4-5.6) and the nutrient status was considered poor (Silvertown *et al.* 2006). Soils from the following treatments of the

152 Park Grass Experiment were used (i) Plot 3, the Control plot where no lime or fertiliser had been added since 1856, (ii) Plot 14 where 96 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> as NaNO<sub>3</sub> has been applied each year 153 since 1858 and (iii) Plot 9 where 96 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> as (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> has been applied each year since 154 1856. Atmospheric NH<sub>4</sub>-N deposition has been estimated as  $\sim$ 2.5 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> a<sup>-1</sup> from 1850 to 1900 155 before rising to  $\sim 10$  kg ha<sup>-1</sup> a<sup>-1</sup> in 1975 and falling to  $\sim 2.5$  kg ha<sup>-1</sup> a<sup>-1</sup> in the 1990's (Blake et al. 156 1999). Similarly, inputs of H<sup>+</sup> have varied between 0.1 and 0.4 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> a<sup>-1</sup>. Treatments receiving 157 fertiliser N also receive yearly applications of 35 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> P as triple superphosphate, 225 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> 158 K as K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>, 15 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> Na as Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and 10 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> Mg as MgSO<sub>4</sub>. The whole experiment 159 160 received a small amount of chalk in the 1880s/1890s. Since then, plots have since been subdivided to allow for different lime applications to produce a range of pH values from 3.5 to 7 161 162 amongst the various combinations of treatments.

163

In the present study, only soil samples from the unlimed plots or subplots collected in 1876, 1904, 1966/1984, and 2002 (0-23 cm) were used to give 4 points on the time-series for the top soil. Changes in the sub soil (49-63 cm) clay mineralogy were monitored using samples from 1870/1876, 1906, 1991 and 2002. Table 1 provides a summary of the samples used.

168

# 169 2.2.2 Comparison between acidic (Geescroft Wilderness) and alkaline (Broadbalk 170 Wilderness) woodland top soils

The Geescroft Wilderness and Broadbalk Wilderness are situated  $\sim$ 700m apart and the soil at both locations is the Batcombe series soil. Geescroft Wilderness was part of an experimental field growing field beans from 1847 to 1878. After bare fallowing for 4 years, clover was grown from 1883 to 1885 and it was then allowed to revert to the current wilderness area in 1886 (Poulton *et al.* 2003). It is dominated by mature oak, remains unlimed since the 18<sup>th</sup> century and has become quite acidic (pH~4.5). Blake *et al.* (1999) studied the chemistry of soil

acidification in these soils and produced a conceptual model that is used as a backdrop to thecurrent XRD results.

179

180 Broadbalk Wilderness lies at the western end of the Broadbalk Wheat experiment. The area 181 that is now the wilderness was sown with wheat from 1843 to 1882 from which it was allowed to revert to woodland (Poulton et al., 2003). It consists of three sections, the woodland which is 182 dominated by mature oak, a section where saplings have been regularly removed (stubbed) 183 since 1900 and an area that has been grazed since 1957. Most importantly, before the 184 185 Broadbalk wheat experiment had started in 1843, the field had been very heavily limed (up to 200 t ha<sup>-1</sup>); the wilderness area still has a pH of  $\sim$  7. Therefore the comparisons between the 186 two wilderness areas will provide information on the changes of clay mineralogy (i) in top soil 187 188 when agricultural land is returned to forestry and (ii) caused by acidification as opposed to the maintenance of pH through the liming of woodland. Only 3 sampling times were available for 189 analysis; the first of which, in 1881 or 1883, was when both sites were still under arable crops 190 191 or fallow (Table 1).

192

#### 193 **2.3 Laboratory methods**

194 Changes in the clay mineralogy caused by land management practices are likely to be subtle 195 and difficult to detect and so the analytical work focussed on the fine clay fraction of the soil 196 ( $<0.2 \mu m$ ).

197 2.3.1 Particle-size separation

Initially, organic C was not removed from the soil so as to protect the clay components from potential changes caused by oxidising agents. The soils were dispersed in deionised water overnight using a reciprocal shaker and 3 minutes of ultrasound treatment (Soniprep 150 201 (MSE)), before wet screening through a 63  $\mu$ m sieve. The >63  $\mu$ m ('sand') fraction was dried 202 at 40°C, weighed and stored. The <63  $\mu$ m material was placed in a gas jar with 2 ml 0.1M sodium hexametaphosphate ('Calgon') solution to disperse the individual clay particles and 203 204 prevent flocculation. After standing for a period determined using Stokes' Law (16 hours for 20 cm drop), a nominal  $<2 \mu m$  ('clay') fraction was removed to a stock beaker. The measuring 205 cylinders were then topped up with deionised water, stirred and the particles allowed to settle 206 before extracting further  $<2 \mu m$  material. This process was repeated until no clay was visibly 207 evident. The remaining 2-63 µm fraction was removed, dried at 40°C, weighed and stored. In 208 209 order to isolate a <0.2 µm fraction, the <2 µm material was centrifuged (Centaur 2 (MSE)) for 210 30 minutes at 3000 rpm before removing the supernatant ( $< 0.2 \mu m$ ) into a stock beaker. The 211 remaining material was then re-dispersed before repeating the procedure two further times. The 212 <0.2 µm ('fine clay') material and remaining 0.2-2 µm ('coarse clay') material were then dried at 40°C, weighed and stored. Organic matter was removed from the  $<0.2 \mu m$  fractions by the 213 214 five-time application of 1M sodium hypochlorite/hydrochloric acid buffer (pH 8.0) following 215 the method of Kaiser et al. (2002). Siregar et al. (2005) suggest that this oxidising agent does not attack pedogenic oxides and hydroxides and only slightly dissolves Al from the poorly 216 crystalline minerals and thus was less likely to cause alteration to the clay minerals than for 217 example, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. 218

#### 219 **2.3.2 Measurements**

Samples for total organic carbon (TOC) analysis were prepared by pre-drying at 100-105°C (1.5 hours), acidifying (HCl, 50% v/v), drying at 100-105°C (1.5 hours), and analysing by combustion (1050°C) using an 'Elementar Vario Max' C/N analyser. CEC was determined by a compulsive displacement technique using a BaCl<sub>2</sub>/triethanolamine (pH 8.1) titration method based on that proposed by Bascomb (1964). Surface-area determinations (SA) were carried out following a procedure based on the formation of a monolayer of 2-ethoxyethanol (EGME) molecules on the clay surface under vacuum (Heilman *et al.*, 1965). Churchman *et al.* (1991) discuss the assumptions necessary within the EGME method including the behaviour of clay type, and time taken to establish end points. In this study samples were expected to have similar mineralogical compositions and a standard method was used throughout. As only small amounts of material were available, 0.2 g of <0.2  $\mu$ m material was covered by ~1 ml of EGME and left for 24 hours before reweighing. A conversion factor of 0.000286 g m<sup>2</sup> was used to calculate total surface area.

# 233 2.3.3 X-ray diffraction analysis

In order to produce high quality diffraction traces, oriented mounts for XRD analysis were 234 produced using 'zero background' silicon crystal substrates. About 15 mg of the dried <0.2 µm 235 236 material was re-suspended in a minimum of deionised water, Ca-saturated using a few drops of 0.1M CaCl<sub>2</sub>.6H<sub>2</sub>O solution, washed, pipetted onto a silicon crystal substrate and allowed to air-237 dry overnight. XRD analysis was carried out using a PANalytical X'Pert Pro series 238 diffractometer fitted with a cobalt-target tube, X'Celerator detector and operated at 45kV and 239 240 40mA. The <0.2  $\mu$ m oriented clay mounts were scanned from 2-35°2 $\theta$  at 0.55°2 $\theta$ /minute after 241 air-drying, ethylene glycol-solvation and heating to 550°C for 2 hours. Clay mineralogy was 242 determined by characteristic peak positions in relation to this diagnostic testing program.

243

In order to obtain further information about the nature of the clay minerals present in the samples, modelling of the XRD profiles was carried out using Newmod-for-Windows<sup>TM</sup> (Reynolds & Reynolds, 1996) software. The modelling process requires the input of diffractometer, scan parameters and a quartz intensity factor (instrumental conditions), and the selection of different phyllosilicate sheet compositions and chemistries. In addition, an estimate of the crystallite size distribution of the clay species may be determined by comparing peak profiles of calculated diffraction profiles with experimental data. Further information on the clay mineralogy of the samples was deduced by decomposition of the XRD profiles into their
elementary component curves using the program DECOMPXR (Lanson, 1993; Lanson &
Besson, 1992). Best fits were obtained using Gaussian curves following background
subtraction and 7-point smoothing.

255

# 256 **2.4 Theoretical considerations**

Theoretically, the responses of the three analyses undertaken (EGME SA, CEC and XRD) 257 should be correlated. Previous work examining a wide range of soil types has demonstrated 258 259 that measurements of clay SA and CEC are positively correlated (Curtin and Smillie, 1976; Peterson et al., 1996), particularly for the B and C horizons. Churchman et al., (1991) suggest 260 261 that this is because EGME is a polar molecule and its uptake is related to both the charge and 262 surface area of the clay. However, for soil A horizons the presence and interactions of organic 263 matter with the clay fraction is known to complicate these relationships. In terms of inorganic components, the SA and CEC of the Rothamsted soils are likely to be determined by the type 264 265 and quantity of I/S minerals present because of the high surface area and CEC of smectite.

266

Recent advances in the power of desktop computers has provided the data processing power 267 necessary to extract further information from XRD profiles. Such processing power is 268 269 required by decomposition routines whereby peak profiles are split into partially overlapping 270 contributions due to phases with distinct but closely related crystallographic characteristics (Lanson, 1997). Decomposition therefore offers the possibility to identify the presence of 271 different phases by monitoring parameters such as peak position, full width at half maximum 272 intensity (FWHM), relative intensity and profile shape. Decomposition routines, such as 273 DECOMPXR (Lanson, 1993), are iterative procedures, the quality of the fit being estimated 274 after each iteration as well as the evolution of the adjusted parameters. The calculation is 275

stopped when the quality of the fit is not improving and/or when adjusted parameters are stable. Due to their small crystallite-size distributions, clay minerals are often characterised by broad and overlapping XRD peaks. This is particularly so for soil clay minerals. Decomposition of soil clay mineral XRD profiles therefore offers a relatively fast identification and descriptive tool, especially suited to establishing trends when studying sample series and variations affecting their components (Lanson, 1997).

282

Characterisation of the I/S species is facilitated by precise measurements of the position of 283 284 their d(001) XRD peaks following decomposition (e.g. Lanson & Velde, 1992). In general terms, a decrease in the d(00l) of I/S species indicates a reduction in the proportion of smectite 285 286 interlayers present and an increase in the number of layers that act in a manner more analogous to illite. In this study on the Rothamsted, such decreases are likely to result from 287 either (i) replacement of hydrated  $Ca^{2+}$  ions in the smectite interlayer space by one or a 288 combination of  $K^+$  or  $NH_4^+$  ions or (ii) soil acidification leading to the deposition of hydroxyl-289 290 Al in the smectite interlayers. Such decreases in I/S d(001) would therefore be expected to correlate with decreases in CEC and SA. 291

292

This 'illitization-like process' in the I/S is most likely driven by wetting and drying cycles and 293 the subsequent reduction of structural Fe(III) in clays, sometimes mediated primarily by the 294 295 enzymatically catalyzed activity of indigenous soil micro-organisms (Favre et al., 2002; Kim et al., 2004; Huggett & Cuadros, 2005; Kostka et al., 1999; Stanjek & Marchel, 2008; Siyuan 296 and Stucki, 1994; Stucki, 1997). The major requirement to enable this collapse in the d(001)297 spacing is a decrease in the positive charge of the octahedral sheet of the smectite. This occurs 298 as structural  $Fe^{3+}$  is reduced to  $Fe^{2+}$ . This causes an increase in CEC and subsequently the 299 ability to fix cations such as K<sup>+</sup>, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, Na<sup>+</sup> or H<sup>+</sup> in the interlayer space to balance the charge 300

301 (Khaled & Stucki, 1991; Kim *et al.*, 2004; Drits and Manceau, 2000; Huggett & Cuadros,
302 2005; Stanjek & Marchel, 2008; Stucki & Kostka, 2006), thus promoting a more illitic type of
303 structure.

304

The input of  $K^+$  into the soil in these experiments will either be through the weathering of 305 minerals such as mica or feldspar, identified in previous XRD analyses of Rothamsted soils 306 (Singh & Goulding, 1997; Blake et al., 1999), through nutrient uplift via roots or through the 307 application of inorganic fertilisers. The similar size of the dehydrated  $NH_4^+$  cation (K<sup>+</sup> = 1.33) 308 Å;  $NH_4^+ = 1.43$  Å), means that it is also capable of collapsing smectite interlayers in I/S (Chen 309 et al., 1989; Drits et al., 1997), thus fixing NH4<sup>+</sup>. Soil acidification, such as that created 310 311 through the application of (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> fertilisers or atmospheric inputs (possibly exacerbated by 312 reforestation; Johnston et al., 1986), is counteracted within the soil by a series of buffering mechanisms (Ulrich, 1992; Wilson et al., 1994; Blake et al., 1999). Ulrich (1992) describes 313 314 one of the by-products of acidity buffering between pH 5 and 4.2 as the deposition of non-315 exchangeable hydroxyl-Al into the interlayer space of clays that contribute to their collapse and decreases in CEC. In addition, if H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> is one of the acidifying agents the formation of 316 amorphous Al-hydroxy-sulphates is possible. However, as soil pH falls below 4.2 the solubility 317 of the hydroxyl-Al compounds increases, and the storage of Al-hydroxy-cations and sulphates 318 319 that have accumulated in the exchanger buffer range decreases.

320

#### 321 **3. Results and discussion**

# 322 **3.1 General characteristics of <0.2 µm clay in top and sub soils**

The general characteristics of soil texture and clay mineralogy in the top soils and sub soils from the Classical Experiments are summarised in Tables 2 & 3. Particle-size analyses are based on all samples examined from each experiment (Table 1). In the Park Grass Experiment

there was an increase in silt content ( $\sim 12$  %) in the top soil compared to the sub soil. This is 326 thought to be a result of the deposition of loess in the late Devensian about 14000-18000 years 327 B.P. (Avery & Catt, 1995). The top soil in the Geescroft and Broadbalk experiments had 328 329 similar particle size distributions. However, less silt was present than in the top soil of the Park Grass Experiment and greater sand and clay contents were found, possibly because of the Hook 330 series, a variation of the Batcomb series, being present across some of the Park Grass 331 Experiment (Avery & Catt, 1995). Alternatively, the period of cultivation that the Broadbalk 332 and Geescroft sites underwent before being retuned to wilderness may have led to a slight 333 334 coarsening of the soil (Lobe et al. 2001; Jolivet et al. 2003). The proportion of fine clay present is generally similar for all the top soils (2.5-5.6 %) but represents a significantly higher 335 proportion of the Park Grass sub soils (12.5%). 336

337

338 Table 3 reports organic carbon (OC) concentrations, CEC and surface area (SA) of the <0.2 µm clay fraction at the earliest date examined from each experiment. It also demonstrates the effect 339 340 of OC removal on CEC and SA properties. As expected, the concentration of OC was higher in top soils due to greater biological activity and particularly so for the Park Grass samples. 341 342 Whereas CEC decreased with OC removal from the top soil, SA increased markedly suggesting its presence was helping form micro-aggregates and thus decreasing the measurable 343 344 SA of the clay (Mikutta et al., 2004). In the sub soil the removal of OC had a minimal effect on 345 CEC and SA. Therefore to remove the effects due to OC it was removed prior to SA and CEC analyses. However, the potential for incomplete removal of OC, and more importantly the 346 different quantities of I/S present made the tracking of changes in SA and CEC for the different 347 348 treatments over time problematic.

349

#### 350 3.2 XRD analyses

351 Typically, XRD analysis of the Rothamsted samples suggests that their fine clay ( $<0.2 \mu m$ )

352 fractions are predominantly composed of I/S, illite and kaolinite clay minerals (Figure 1). 353 These results are similar to previous analyses of the  $<0.2 \mu m$  fraction of the Broadbalk Experiment by Singh & Goulding (1997). However these authors identified the interstratified 354 355 phase as a smectite/vermiculite. Decomposition of the XRD traces using DECOMPXR indicates that the 4 -11 °20 range is composed of three different sub-species (Figure 2). 356 NEWMOD-modelling suggests that the three peaks represent a high smectite I/S phase (~15 357 Å), a low smectite I/S phase (~12.5 Å), and an 'illite' phase (~11.2 Å). XRD analyses of 358 359 samples prior to and following OC-removal suggest a small (~0.2 Å) increase in the d(001)spacing of each of the three sub-species. Velde et al. (2003) reported similar findings and 360 suggested that OC was responsible for closing some of the smectite interlayers. When 361 362 comparing management and land use effects on clay particles in the present study we report those obtained prior to OC-removal to ensure minimal damage to the clay minerals susceptible 363 to decomposition from hypochlorite. 364

365

General properties of the decomposed XRD peaks for each experiment are shown in Table 4, 366 including the peak position (Å), the peak full width at half maximum (FWHM, °20) and the % 367 area of the total peak. The high smectite I/S presents a relatively broad XRD peak with a mean 368 369 FWHM of ~1.9 in all the samples, indicative of very small crystallite-size distributions. The low smectite I/S mineral has mean FWHM values in the range 1.2 - 1.5, while smaller mean 370 FWHM values of ~1 were measured for the illitic phase suggesting larger crystallites than in 371 the I/S phases. The area beneath each of the decomposed peaks can be used to broadly indicate 372 the relative proportions of each phase present, particularly if the angular factor is taken into 373 374 account. As indicated in Table 4, the high smectite I/S (43-79 %) phase dominates both top soil and sub-soil with lesser amounts of the low smectite I/S and 'illite' mineral phases. 375

376 In previous investigations, peak decomposition modelling techniques have enabled subtle

changes in the I/S d(00l) spacing with time to be monitored (e.g. Bain & Griffen, 2002; Mathe *et al.*, 2007, Pernes-Debuyser *et al.* 2003; Velde & Peck, 2002). In these studies changes in peak movements of less than ~0.4 Å have often been reported and discussed. However in the present study, trends have only been identified where peak movements of >0.4 Å are evident.

381

# 382 **3.3 Fertiliser effects on top and sub soils using Park Grass samples**

Results from the Control treatment sampled in the early years of the experiment (1870/1876) demonstrate differences in the measured CEC and SA properties of the top and sub soil (Table 3). After the removal of OC, the <0.2  $\mu$ m clay particles of the top soil possessed a higher CEC and SA than the sub soil.

387

#### 388 3.3.1 Park Grass top soil

Analyses undertaken on the <2 mm soil fraction give an indication of changes in pH and 389 exchangeable cation status in the top soil relevant to this study (data from Rothamsted 390 391 Research, Figures 3 and 4). The initial (1856) pH value of the Park Grass soil has been estimated as ~5.5 (Johnston et al., 1986). Since the inception of the experiment, the soil pH of 392 the 'control treatment' has declined slightly to ~5.1. After NaNO<sub>3</sub> treatment soil pH increased. 393 This may have been due to a combination of Na<sup>+</sup> ions occupying cation exchange sites in place 394 of  $H^+$  ions and the increase in pH related to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake by plants. Soil treated with (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> 395 396 has undergone acidification to pH values of ~3.5. Values for extractable K, Ca, Mg, and Na (Figure 4) reflect fertiliser inputs and off-takes in the herbage (section 2.2.1). 397

398

The first set of samples analysed in the present work were taken  $\sim 20$  years after the initiation of the Park Grass Experiment. There were no identifiable trends in  $<0.2 \mu m$  clay CEC and SA values in the plots over the period the data covers, despite the acidification that has occurred on 402 the  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$  plots (Figure 3, Table 2). Changes in the position of the d(001) spacing for the three identified XRD phases for the Control, NaNO<sub>3</sub> and (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> treatments are summarised 403 in Figure 5. There was a great deal of variability in the high smectite I/S phase (Figure 5a), 404 405 presumably as it contains the highest proportion of smectite interlayers. This variability is likely a result of the high smectite I/S phase being the main reservoir and source of K<sup>+</sup> for plant 406 requirements (Barré et al. 2007a & b). The d(001) spacing found in the high smectite I/S 407 minerals from the (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> or NaNO<sub>3</sub> plots was consistently smaller than that found in the 408 control. This difference was present at the first sampling point (1870), taken after ~20 years of 409 repeated fertilisation and suggests that the presence of increased K<sup>+</sup> from the fertilisers in the 410 first 20 years of the experiment may have already created a difference by the first analysis in 411 this study. The maximum difference (1906) was ~0.8 Å, but was ~0.4 Å in 2001. 412

413

Only one trend was apparent in the d(001) spacing of the low smectite I/S phase (Figure 5b) 414 415 and this was found in the  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$  treatment. Relatively little variation in d(001) spacing was 416 found between all treatments for much of the study period. However, in 2002, a sudden ~0.8 Å collapse in the d(001) spacing of the (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> sample was detected. A possible explanation 417 for this is that as the soil pH falls to  $\sim 3.5$  (Figure 3), the increasing acidity is buffered by the 418 release of the hydroxy-Al and hydroxy-Al sulphates previously deposited in the interlayer 419 spaces (Ulrich et al., 1992). This could be considered a mild form of the acid-activation 420 421 process used on bentonites; a treatment used to increase the SA of smectite-group minerals for industrial uses (e.g. Christidis et al., 1997). Further indications of this process were found in 422 the SA measurement which increased from around an average of 366 m<sup>2</sup> g<sup>-1</sup> to  $591m^2$  g<sup>-1</sup> for 423 this last measurement. As this process occurred interlayer space that was occupied by 424 hydroxyl-Al may have become unoccupied, allowing  $K^+$  or  $NH_4^+$  to enter and to collapse it. 425 There was little variation found in the d(001) spacing for the 'illite' phase (Figure 5c). The 426

427 position of the peak at ~11.2 Å suggests that it contains a small number of smectite interlayers 428 and so may show a more limited response to increased  $K^+$  availability or acidification processes 429 already described.

430

It was interesting to note that greater differences were not found between such different 431 treatments in the Park Grass top soil, especially as soil conditions exist which have been shown 432 to cause changes in I/S minerals (e.g. increasing soil K<sup>+</sup> and/or acidity). This may have been 433 due to (i) the continued recycling of nutrients and the addition of fertilisers producing 434 435 competition for interlayer spaces in the I/S layers, (ii) the differences in yearly plant requirements of  $K^+$ , balanced by the weathering of micas and uplift of  $K^+$  and (iii) the role of 436 437 organic carbon (10.7 % in the fine clay fraction; Table 3) in protecting the clay minerals by 438 preventing access to interlayer spaces or by aggregating clay particles. In particular the protection, through restriction of access to I/S minerals by organic carbon and increased 439 competition by H<sup>+</sup> ions for interlayer sites may be a reason why there was a time lag between 440 441 soil pH values decreasing and the later collapse of the interlayer space in the  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$ 442 treatment.

443

#### 444 **3.3.2 Park Grass Sub soil**

Changes in the clay mineralogy of the sub soil under the Park Grass Experiment were examined to determine how management practices of the top soil may have impacted on the sub soil clay mineralogy. Figure 6 shows a range of sub soil (<2 mm) characteristics for the 2002 samples; earlier sampling dates were not re-analysed. The different fertiliser treatments have caused changes in the characteristics of the <2 mm soil fraction. After the yearly application of  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$  and other fertilisers, the pH has dropped to ~4.2, compared to pH ~6 of the control plot. Exchangeable K<sup>+</sup> has increased whilst exchangeable Ca has decreased, 452 probably to be replaced by exchangeable  $Al(OH)_x$  species,  $Al^{3+}$  and  $H^+$ . Following NaNO<sub>3</sub> and 453 fertiliser application, pH has marginally increased to ~6.2 and both exchangeable K<sup>+</sup> and Na<sup>+</sup> 454 have increased in concentration.

455

No overall treatment trend was found for either CEC or SA in the <0.2 µm clay fraction from 456 the sub soil samples. Figure 7 shows the change in d(001) spacing for the three identified I/S 457 phases. For the high smectite I/S (Figure 7a), the initial spread of data points for the different 458 plots is greater than for the top soil, possibly reflecting a greater range and distribution of 459 460 variously hydrated cations present in the smectite interlayers. Only one identifiable trend was found in the high smectite I/S; a consistent decrease in d(001) spacing in the control plot over 461 the study period. Values fell from 15.5 - 14.7 Å and may have been a result of the interaction 462 between naturally weathered K<sup>+</sup> with the smectite interlayers. This response contrasts with 463 samples of the (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and NaNO<sub>3</sub> treatments where no trends were observable despite 464 large increases in exchangeable  $K^+$  being found from the leaching of fertiliser (Figure 6b). In 465 the low smectite I/S minerals a decrease from ~12.9- 12.5 Å was found in the NaNO3 466 treatment. This is likely due to the presence of  $K^+$  ions and their substitution with  $Ca^{2+}$  ions. 467 No identifiable trends > 0.4 Å were found in the illite phase. 468

469

A possible explanation why greater decreases were found in the control plot than in the NaNO<sub>3</sub> and  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$  treatments is competition from other ions. For example, the annual addition of NaNO<sub>3</sub> fertiliser would introduce Na<sup>+</sup> ions, as well as those from the other mineral fertilisers applied. Subsequently, as a result of this competition from other ions, the K<sup>+</sup> ions may not have been able to access sites in the smectite interlayers (Stucki & Huo, 1996) with such ease and were thus retained on the more selective frayed edge sites of the smectite component (Goulding & Talibudeen, 1978). For the (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> treatment, the increasing presence of H<sup>+</sup> ions as the

- soil acidified may have increased competition with both  $K^+ \& Al^{3+}$  ions in I/S interlayers.
- 478

# 479 3.4 Comparison between acidic (Geescroft Wilderness) and alkaline (Broadbalk 480 Wilderness) woodland top soils

In Broadbalk Wilderness, the soil still contains some free CaCO<sub>3</sub> following large applications 481 of chalk in the  $18^{th}$  and early  $19^{th}$  centuries; soil pH is still >7 (Section 2.1.3). In contrast, in 482 Geescroft Wilderness which had little or no chalk applied, soil acidity has developed over time 483 (Figure 8). Again there are no detectable trends in the CEC and SA measurements (results not 484 485 shown). Figure 9 shows the changes in the d(001) spacing for each of the I/S phases in the samples from the two woodland sites. The 1881-83 samples show differences in the d(001)486 spacings between the two sites for each of the three phases, possibly as a result of slight 487 488 differences in the parent material or previous weathering processes or land-use. For the high 489 smectite I/S (Figure 9a), there is a large variation in the d(001) spacing but no overall trend 490 could be identified at either site. The only readily identifiable trend was found in the 491 progressively acidifying Geescroft Wilderness soil, where a decrease in the d(001) spacing of ~13.0 to 12.5 Å was found in the low smectite I/S phase through the period examined. 492 Although a steady decrease appeared in the illite phase in the Geescroft Wilderness, this is 493 considered too small to be definite trend. However, in the neutral Broadbalk Wilderness there 494 was minimal change in the d(001) spacing measurements for both the low smectite I/S or 495 496 'illite' phases.

497

In the Geescroft Wilderness, the soil pH had dropped to  $\sim$ pH 4.5, a pH where the main reaction products are non-exchangeable polymeric Al-hydroxy-cations (Ulrich, 1991) which can form in the interlayer space of smectite clays, thus decreasing *d001* spacings. Blake *et al.* (1999) examined the changes in soil chemistry (<2 mm) with acidification in Geescroft Wilderness 502 and reported decreases in soil effective cation exchange capacity (ECEC), although these 503 measurements would include the decrease in pH-dependent charge of soil organic matter found with decreasing soil pH. They suggested that the decrease in ECEC was partially a result of 504 505 clay particles being covered with amphoteric Al hydroxyl cations which restricts isomorphous 506 substitution and changes permanent charge into pH-dependent charge. An initial examination of clay mineralogy in the Geescroft experiment by Blake et al. (1999) was reported as a pers. 507 comm. and indicated that 'with time, the interstratified swelling mineral expands less readily on 508 solvation with ethylene glycol'. This would confirm the results reported in the present study 509 510 regarding the decreasing d(001) spacing in the low smectite I/S phase in the Geescroft soil. The comparison between the acidic and alkaline woodlands appears to suggest that where soil 511 pH is maintained by application of CaCO<sub>3</sub>, the potential for the collapse of smectite interlayers 512 decreases as a result of competition from weathered  $Ca^{2+}$  ions for interlayer spaces. 513

514

#### 515 **4. General Discussion**

516 The results obtained, taken in conjunction with those of several other studies (Bain & Griffen, 2002; Barak et al. 1997; Velde & Peck, 2002; Velde et al., 2003; Righi et al., 1995; Mathé et 517 al., 2007), provide further evidence that subtle changes can occur with time in clay minerals 518 519 subjected to different land management practices. However, after analysing a diverse selection of samples in terms of pH and nutrient status, it was surprising that greater differences were not 520 seen. This was in spite of conditions of acidity and K<sup>+</sup> status that have been found to promote 521 the collapse of the d(001) interlayer in I/S clay minerals. Despite a small number of identifiable 522 changes being found, results generally suggest that within the context of the general use of 523 soils in agriculture and forestry, I/S minerals of the Batcombe series soil are fairly resilient to 524 substantial changes. This resilience appears to be derived from other soil factors. These include 525 (i) the application of fertiliser and liming applications that increase the number of competing 526

ions to  $K^+$ , thus decreasing access to interlayer sorption sites in the smectite (e.g. Ca<sup>2+</sup>and Na<sup>+</sup>), (ii) in acidifying soils, the presence of H<sup>+</sup> providing competition for K<sup>+</sup> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> ions, (iii) the weathering of mica and feldspar and the recycling of K<sup>+</sup> and (iv) the presence of organic carbon that can physically reduce the accessibility to clay minerals by creating aggregates as well as potentially entering the interlayer space (Velde *et al.*, 2003).

532

With respect to the functioning of soil I/S minerals in agricultural and natural systems, where 533 decreases in d(001) spacing were identified it would be expected that some of the smectite in 534 535 the I/S minerals will behave more like illite. Typically, this could involve a loss of CEC and suppress the ability of clays to swell. The interaction of  $K^+$  with the interlayer spaces of 536 smectite is obviously important and much of the general variation in d001 spacing, in all three 537 I/S phases, will be caused by the interactions of  $K^+$  with the growth demands of the plants. 538 Barré et al. (2008) identified reversible changes in five different 2:1 minerals with either K<sup>+</sup> 539 addition or by removal by plants. Decreases in d(001) spacing caused by K<sup>+</sup> entering the 540 interlayer space of the I/S minerals is at least partially reversible. Barré et al. (2007a) 541 demonstrated that changes in I/S minerals as a result of K<sup>+</sup> removal by plants could occur 542 within 14 days and that plants could extract more K<sup>+</sup> than was found within the exchangeable 543 K<sup>+</sup> fraction. XRD analyses demonstrated a decrease in both well crystallised and poorly 544 crystallised illite after plants had been grown for 31 days. Thus Barré et al. (2007b) suggest 545 that 'illite like layers' act as a dynamic reservoir of  $K^+$ . The decrease in d(001) spacing would 546 also be reversible in the sub soil as long as it is within the rooting zone where possible uplift of 547 nutrients may occur (Jobbágy & Jackson, 2001 & 2004). Deist & Talibudeen (1967 a & b) 548 demonstrated that the exchange isotherm  $K^+$ -Ca<sup>2+</sup> in 2:1 clays is rarely completely reversible 549 and that K<sup>+</sup> entering the interlayer space can lead to the (i) trapping of cations as it collapses 550 the d(001) spacing or (ii) the K<sup>+</sup> becomes fixed and thus not exchangeable leading to a loss of 551

CEC. Whilst results from this study suggest that, under typical agricultural practices of 552 fertiliser use and liming, the effect of  $K^+$  causing collapse of the d(001) spacing was minimal, 553 small losses of CEC could result in a loss of nutrients through leaching or the trapping of  $NH_4^+$ 554 555 ions in the interlayer space thus preventing nitrification (Chappell & Evangelou, 2000). The loss of CEC and swelling capacity also has implications for reducing the soil's ability to 556 attenuate contaminants. No previous studies have reported the long-term effects of 557 management practices or natural weathering processes in the sub soil where the filtering of 558 ground and surface is a major function. This study suggests that in natural or unmanaged soils, 559 where soil pH is around neutral,  $K^+$  released through weathering can decrease the d(001)560 spacing in I/S minerals in the sub soil and over long periods, the ability of the sub soil to act as 561 562 a filtration system for ground and surface waters could therefore be reduced.

563

564 In terms of afforestation the use of chemical assays suggested that a permanent reduction in CEC and SA of the clay could develop if soils were allowed to acidify and hydroxyl-Al 565 566 compounds precipitated in the interlayer space (Blake et al. 1999). The results presented for the I/S minerals from the Geescroft Wilderness provide further evidence for such phenomena. 567 Once acidified, liming the soil to reduce acidity will not lead to the precipitated interlayer Al 568 becoming soluble. Therefore, when reforestation is undertaken, the results from this study and 569 that of Blake et al., (1999) clearly demonstrate the appropriateness of a long-term liming 570 571 strategy for woodland to preserve clay function.

572

#### 573 **5. Conclusions**

Our results demonstrate the extent to which I/S mineral phases in the top and sub soil undergo alteration in both natural and agricultural ecosystems under long term land management practices. Both  $K^+$ -plant interactions and soil acidity buffering processes can determine a

change in the structure of I/S minerals. However, our results suggest that typical agronomic 577 practices such as liming, the presence of organic carbon, and plant K<sup>+</sup> requirements may largely 578 counteract the 'illitization-like process' whereby I/S minerals take on more illite-like properties 579 580 in top soil and sub soil. The decrease in d(001) spacing observed in sub soil I/S minerals in conditions close to those of natural ecosystems warrant further investigation. Evidence suggests 581 that  $K^+$  released through weathering of mica and K-feldspars may decrease d(001) spacing and 582 subsequently CEC therefore having potential effects on the filtration capacity of I/S minerals. 583 The results also demonstrate the necessity to consider liming programs when afforestation of 584 585 agricultural land is undertaken to avoid permanent loss of clay CEC function.

586

# 587 6. Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Doris Wagner and Barbara Vickers for the preparation and the analyses they undertook. Rothamsted Research receives grant-aided support from the U.K. Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council. AMT & SJK publish with the permission of the Director of the British Geological Survey.

592

## 593 7. References

Avery, B.W. 1980. Soil Classification for England and Wales (Higher Categories). Soil Survey
Technical Monograph No. 14. Harpenden.

596

Avery, B.W. & Catt, J.A. 1991. The soil at Rothamsted. Lawes Agricultural Trust, IACRRothamsted, Harpenden, UK, pp.44.

599

Bain, D.C. & Griffen, D.T. 2002. Possible effects of land use on the clay mineralogy of a

brown forest soil. Clay Minerals, 37, 663-670.

602	Barré P., Velde, B., Catel, N. & Abbadie, L. 2007a. Soil-plant potassium transfer: impact of
603	plant activity on clay minerals as seen from X-ray diffraction. Plant Soil, 292, 137-146.
604	

- Barré P., Velde, B. & Abbadie, L. 2007b. Dynamic role of 'illite-like' clay minerals in
  temperate soils: facts and hypotheses. Biogeochemistry, 82, 77-88.
- 607

Barré P., Velde, B., Fontaine, C., Catel, N. & Abbadie, L. 2008. Which 2:1 clay minerals are
involved in the soil potassium reservoir? Insights from potassium addition or removal
experiments on three temperate grassland soil clay assemblages.
Doi:10.1016/j.geoderma.2008.05.022

612

Barak, P., Jobe, B.O., Krueger, A.R., Peterson, L.A. & Laird, D.A. 1997. Effects of long-term
soil acidification inputs in Wisconsin. Plant and Soil, 197(1), 61-69.

615

Bascomb, C.L. 1964. Rapid method for the determination of cation exchange capacity of
calcareous and non-calcareous soils. Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture 15, 821823.

619

Blake, L., Goulding, K.W.T., Mott, C.J.B., & Johnston, A.E. 1999. Changes in soil chemistry
accompanying acidification over more than 100 years under woodland and grass at Rothamsted
Experimental Station, UK. European Journal of Soil Science, 50(3), 401-412.

623

Blake, L., Goulding, K.W.T., Mott, C.J.B., & Poulton, P.R. 2000. Temporal changes in
chemical properties of air-dried stored soils and their interpretation for long-term experiments.
European Journal of Soil Science, 51(2), 345-353.

627 Catt, J.A. & Hodgson, J.M. 1976. Soils and geomorphology of the chalk in South-East
628 England. Earth Surface Processes, 1, 181-193.

629

- Chappell, M.A. & Evangelou, V.P. 2000. Influence of added K<sup>+</sup> on inducing ammonium
  fixation and inhibiting nitrification. Soil Science, 165(5), 420-426.
- 632
- Chen, X., Zhu, Y., Hong, M., Kappler, A. & Xu, Y. 2008. Effects of different forms of
  Nitrogen fertilisers on arsenic uptake by rice plants. Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry,
  4, 881-997.

636

Christidis, G.E., Scott, P.W. & Dunham, A.C. 1997. Acid activation and bleaching capacity of
bentonites from the islands of Milos and Chios, Aegean, Greece. Applied Clay Science, 12,
329-347.

640

Churchman, G.J., Burke, C.M. & Parfitt, R.L. 1991. Comparison of various methods for the
determination of specific surfaces of sub soils. Journal of Soil Science, 42, 449-461.

643

Curtin, D. & Smillie, G.W. 1976. Estimation of components of soil cation exchange capacity
from measurements of specific surface and organic matter. Soil Science Society America
Journal, 40, 461-462.

647

Deist, J. & Talibudeen, O. 1967a. Ion exchange in soils from the ion pairs K-Ca, K-Rb and KNa. Journal of Soil Science, 18(1), 125-137.

650

Deist, J. & Talibudeen, O. 1967b. Thermodynamics of K-Ca exchange in soils. Journal of Soil

- 652 Science, 18(1), 138-149.
- 653
- Drits, V.A. & Manceau, A. 2000. A model for the mechanism of  $Fe^{3+}$  to  $Fe^{2+}$  reduction in Dioctahedral smectites. Clays and Clay Mineralogy, 48(2), 185-195.
- 656
- Egli, M., Mirabella, A., Sartori, G., Giaccai, D., Zanelli, R. & Plotze. M. 2007. Effect of slope
  aspect on transformation of clay minerals in Alpine soils. Clay Minerals, 42, 373 398.
- Favre, F., Tessier, D., Abdelmoula, M., Génin, J.M., Gates, W.P. & Boivin, P. Iron reduction
   and changes in cation exchange capacity in intermittently waterlogged soil. European Journal
- 662 of Soil Science, 53, 175-183.
- 663
- Goulding, K.W.T. & Talibudeen, O. 1979. Potassium reserves in a sandy clay soil from the
  Saxmundham Experiment: Kinetics and equilibrium thermodynamics. Journal of Soil Science,
  30, 291-302.
- 667
- Heilman, M.D., Carter, D.L. & Gonzalez, C.L. 1965. The ethylene glycol monoethyl ether
  (EGME) technique for determining soil-surface area. Soil Science, 100, 409-413.
- 670
- Huggett, J.M. & Cuadros, J. 2005. Low-temperature illitization of smectite in the late Eocene
  and early Oligocene of the Isle of Wight (Hampshire basin), U.K.. American Mineralogist, 90,
  1192-1202.
- 674
- Huggett, J.M. & Knox, R.W.O'B. 2006. Clay mineralogy of the Tertiary onshore and offshore
  strata of the British Isles. Clay Minerals, 41, 5-46.
  - 27

- Jobbágy, E.G. & Jackson, R.B. 2001. The distribution of soil nutrients with depth: Global
  patterns and imprint of plants. Biogeochemistry, 53, 51-77.
- 679
- Jobbágy, E.G. & Jackson, R.B. 2004. The uplift of soil nutrients by plants: Biogeochemical
  consequences across scales. Ecology, 85(9), 2380-2389.
- 682
- Johnston, A.E. 1997. The value of long term field experiments in agricultural, ecological and
  environmental research. Advances in Agronomy, 59, 291-333.
- 685
- Johnston, A.E., Goulding, K.W.T. & Poulton, P.R. 1986. Soil acidification during more than
  100 years under permanent grassland and woodland at Rothamsted. Soil Use and Management,
  2, 3-10.
- 689
- Jolivet, C., Arrouyas, D., Lévéque, J., Andreux, F. & Chenu, C. 2003. Organic carbon
  dynamics in soil particle seperates of sandy Spodosols when forest is cleared for maize
  cropping. European Journal of Soil Science, 54, 257-268.
- 693

Kaiser, K., Eusterhues, K., Rumpel, C., Guggenberger, G. & Kögel-Knabner, I. 2002.
Stabilization of organic matter by soil minerals – investigations of density and particle-size
fractions from two acid forest soils. Journal of Plant Nutrition and Soil Science 165, 451-459.

697

- Khaled, E.M., & Stucki, J.W. 1991. Iron oxidation state effects on cation fixation in smectites.
  Soil Science Society America Journal, 55, 550-554.
- 700

- Kim, J., Dong, H., Seabaugh, J., Newell, S.W. & Eberl, D.D. 2004. Role of microbes in the
  smectite-illite reaction. Science, 303, 830-832.
- 704
- Kostka, J.E., Wu, J., Nealson, K.H. & Stucki, J.W. 1999. The impact of structural Fe(III)
  reduction by bacteria on the surface chemistry of smectite clay minerals. Geochimica et
  Cosmoschimica Acta, 63(22), 3705-3713.
- 708
- Lanson, B. 1993. DECOMPXR, X-ray decomposition program. ERM (Sarl), Poitiers, France.
- Lanson, B. 1997. Decomposition of experimental X-ray diffraction patterns (profile fitting): a

convenient way to study clay minerals. Clays and Clay Minerals, 45, 132 146.

- 713
- Lanson, B. & Besson, G. 1992. Characterization of the end of smectite- to illitetransformation: Decomposition of X-ray patterns. Clays and Clay Minerals, 40, 40-52.
- 716
- Lanson, B. & Velde, B. 1992. Decomposition of X-ray diffraction patterns, a convenient way

to describe complex I/S diagenetic evolution. Clays and Clay Minerals, 40, 629-643.

- Lobe, I., Amelung, W. & Du Preez, C.C. 2001. Losses of carbon and nitrogen with prolonged
  arable cropping from sandy soils of the South African Highveld. European Journal of Soil
  Science, 52, 93-101.
- 723
- Mathe, V., Meunier, A. & Leveque, F. 2007. Anthropic acceleration of a natural clay mineral
  reaction in marshland soils (Atlantic Coast, France). Clay Minerals, 42, 1 12.
- 726

- Matocha, C.J. & Coyne, M.S. 2007. Short term response of soil iron to nitrate addition. Soil
  Science Society America Journal, 71(1), 108-117.
- 729
- McGahan, D.G., Southard, R.J. & Zasoski, R.J. 2003. Mineralogical comparison of
  agriculturally acidified and naturally acidic soils. Geoderma, 114, 355-368.
- 732
- Mikutta, C., Lang, F. & Kaupenjohann, M. 2004. Soil organic matter clogs mineral pores:
  Evidence from1H-NMR and N2 adsorption. Soil Science Society America Journal, 68, 18531862.
- 736
- Moore, D M & Reynolds, R C. 1997. X-Ray Diffraction and the Identification and Analysis of
  Clay Minerals, Second Edition. Oxford University Press, New York.
- 739
- 740 Pernes-Debuyser, a., Pernes, M., Velde, B. & Tessier, D. 2003. Soil mineralogy evolution in
- the INRA 42 plots experiment (Versailles, France). Clays and Clay minerals, 5195, 577-584.
- 742
- Petersen, L.W., Moldrup, P., Jacobsen, O.H. & Rolston, D.E. 1996. Relations between specific
  surface area and soil physical and chemical properties. Soil Science, 161(1), 9-20.
- 745
- Poulton, P.R., Pye, E., Hargreaves, P.R. & Jenkinson, D.S. 2003. Accumulation of carbon and
- nitrogen by old arable land reverting to woodland. Global Change Biology, 9, 942-955.
- 748
- 749 Reynolds, R C & Reynolds, R C. 1996. Description of Newmod-for-Windows<sup>TM</sup>. The
- calculation of one-dimensional X-ray diffraction patterns of mixed layered clay minerals. R C
- 751 Reynolds Jr., 8 Brook Road, Hanover, NH.

Righi, D., Velde, B. and Meunier, A. 1995. Clay stability in clay-dominated soil systems.
Clay Minerals, Vol. 30, 45-54.

754

- Silvertown, J., Poulton, P., Johnston, E., Edwards, G., Heard, M. & Biss, P.M. 2006. The Park
- Grass Experiment 1856-2006: Its contribution to ecology. Journal of Ecology, 94, 801-814.

757

- Singh, B. & Goulding, K.W.T. 1997. Changes with time in the potassium content and
  phyllosilicates in the soil of the Broadbalk continuous wheat experiment at Rothamsted.
  European Journal of Soil Science, 48, 651-659.
- 761

Siregar, A., Kleber, M., Mikutta, R. & Jahn, R. 2005. Sodium hypochlorite oxidation reduces
soil organic matter concentrations without affecting inorganic constituents. European Journal
of Soil Science, 56(4), 481-490.

765

Siyuan, S. & Stucki, J. 1994. Effects of iron oxidation state on the fate and behaviour of
potassium in soils. In: Soil Testing: Prospects for Improving Nutrient Recommendations, p.
173–185. Soil Science Society of America Special Publication 40.

769

Stanjek, H. & Marchel, C. 2008. Linking the redox cycles of Fe oxides and Fe-rich clay
minerals: an example from a palaeosol of the Upper Freshwater Molasse. Clay Minerals, 43,
69-82.

- Stucki, J. 1997. Redox processes in smectites: Soil environmental significance. Advances in
  GeoEcology, 30, 395–406.
- 776

Stuki, J.W. & Huo, D. 1996. Effects of cation competition on Potassium fixation. Illinois
Fertiliser Conference Proceedings.

779

- Stucki, J.W. & Kostka, J.E. 2006. Microbial reduction of iron in smectite. C.R. Geoscience,
  338, 468-475.
- 782
- <sup>783</sup> Ulrich, B. 1991. An ecosystem approach to soil acidification. In *Soil Acidity* (eds B. Ulrich &
  <sup>784</sup> M.E. Sumner), pp.28-79. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- 785
- U.S.D.A. 1992. Soil Survey Staff. Key to taxonomy, SMSS Technical Monograph No.19; 5<sup>th</sup>
   Edition, Pocahontas Press Inc., Blacksburg, Virginia.
- 788
- Velde, B. 2001. Clay minerals in the agricultural surface soils in the Central United States.
  Clay Minerals 36, 277-294.
- 791
- Velde, B. & Peck, T. 2002. Clay mineral changes in the Morrow Experimental Plots,
  University of Illinois. Clays and Clay Minerals, 50(3), 364-370.
- 794
- Velde, B., Goffé, B. & Hoellard, A. 2003. Evolution of clay minerals in a chronosequence of
  poldered sediments under the influence of a natural pasture development. Clays and Clay
  Minerals, 51(2), 205-217.
- 798
- Wilson, M.J., Blake, L. & Goulding, K. 1994. Effects of acid precipitation upon soil clay
  mineralogy as assessed by the Rothamsted Classical Field Experiments. 16<sup>th</sup> General meeting
  of the International Mineralogical Association, Pisa, pp. 1-2.

# **Table 1:** Resume of samples from the Rothamsted Classical Experiment archive used in the

803 current work.

1856	-	
1856		
	Top soil (0-23 cm)	
	Control	1876, 1904, 1966, 2002
	$(NH_4)_2SO_4$	1876, 1904, 1984, 2002
	NaNO <sub>3</sub>	1876, 1904, 1984, 2002
1856	Sub soil (46-69cm)	
	Control	1876, 1906, 1966, 2002
	$(NH_4)_2SO_4$	1870, 1906, 1984, 2002
	NaNO <sub>3</sub>	1876, 1906, 1984, 2002
1882	Top soil (0-23 cm)	1881, 1944, 1999
1006	$T_{an}$ and $(0, 22, am)$	1992 1065 1000
	1882	Control (NH <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>2</sub> SO <sub>4</sub> NaNO <sub>3</sub> 1882         Top soil (0-23 cm)           1886         Top soil (0.23 cm)

)

837 Table 2: Particle size distributions for samples taken from each experiment. Averages are
838 based on all samples analysed from each experiment.

Experiment (sample)		Sand 2mm - 63µm	Silt 63 - 2µm	Coarse Clay 2 – 0.2µm	Fine Clay < 0.2µm
		%	%	%	%
Park Grass (top soil)	Mean	16.5	72.5	8.5	2.5
(n=12)	SD	4.5	3.6	1.2	0.8
Park Grass (sub soil)	Mean	11.8	59.9	15.7	12.5
(n=12)	SD	5.7	6.1	1.2	2.6
Geescroft Wilderness (top soil)	Average	21.4	60.3	12.7	5.6
(n=3)	SD	1.1	2.4	1.3	1.2
Broadbalk Wilderness (top soil)	Average	21.1	61.1	13.5	4.3
(n=3)	SD	1.7	3.2	3.1	1.5

Table 3: Measured properties of top (0-23 cm) and sub soil (46-69 cm) fine clay fractions.
CEC and surface area properties are shown before and after the removal of organic carbon.
Values from the Park Grass Experiment are the mean of the 3 treatment plots from the earliest
sampling point of the time series (1870/1876). Values from the Geescroft (1883) and
Broadbalk (1881) Wilderness are also the earliest point of their respective time series.

Experiment (sample)	Treatment		OC	CEC	Surface Area
			%	cmolc kg <sup>-1</sup>	$m^2 g^{-1}$
Park Grass (top soil)	none	Mean	10.7	78.4	68
		SD	2.8	3.5	18
Park Grass (top soil)	OC leached	Mean	Nm	70.6	366
		SD	Nm	5.2	31
Park Grass (sub soil)	none	Mean	1.1	56.0	362
		SD	0.1	2.3	36
Park Grass (sub soil)	OC leached	Mean	Nm	55.8	348
		SD	Nm	4.2	13
Geescroft Wilderness (top soil)	none		2.61	61.2	333
	OC leached		Nm	68.3	358
Broadbalk Wilderness (top soil)	None		3.19	64.2	303
,	OC leached		Nm	49.0	328

- 879 Nm = Not measured
- 882
  883
  884
  885
  886
  887
  888
  889

**Table 4:** Properties of XRD traces obtained after peak decomposition for top and sub soil samples. The range and average values are taken from allmeasurements for each experiment over the period 1870 – 2002 for the Park Grass Experiment, 1883 – 1996 for the Geescroft Wilderness and

Evneriment (samnle)		High smeetite I/S			Low smeetite I/S			'Illite'		
Experiment (sample)		Å	FWHM	% Area	Å	FWHM	, % Area	Å	FWHM	% Area
Park Grass (top soil)	Range	14.5 -15.3	1.7 -2.0	46 - 69	11.9 -13.1	1.0 -1.73	11 - 37	11.1 -11.5	0.58 -1.5	7 -29
	Mean	14.82	1.85	61	12.54	1.34	21.6	11.26	1.06	17.44
	SD	0.27	0.12	7.14	0.38	0.2	8.20	0.13	0.28	7.57
Park Grass (sub soil)	Range	14.7 – 15.4	1.5 - 2.05	50 -74	12.4 – 12.9	0.81 – 1.39	6 - 35	11.2 – 11.5	0.92 – 1.35	13 – 24
	Mean	15.0	1.88	63.22	12.65	1.19	18.89	11.27	1.09	17.9
	SD	0.25	0.16	7.85	0.17	0.2	9.27	0.1	0.13	3.7
Geescroft Wilderness (top soil)	Range	14.7 – 15.3	1.86 - 2.25	64 - 79	12.4 - 13.0	1.08 - 1.6	9 - 29	11.2 – 11.5	0.82 – 1.16	7 – 15
	Mean	14.9	2.0	71.3	12.6	1.3	17.3	11.3	1.0	11.8
	SD	0.3	0.2	0.2	0.3	0.3	8.9	0.1	0.1	0.1
Broadbalk Wilderness (top soil)	Range	14.5 - 15.1	1.62 - 2.22	43 - 73	12.0 - 12.9	1.1 – 1.9	8 - 49	11.1 – 11.4	0.8 – 1.2	8-21
)	Mean	14.8	1.9	55.5	12.4	1.5	31.5	11.2	0.9	12.8
	SD	0.2	0.2	11.8	0.3	0.3	16.6	0.1	0.2	5.3

1881- 1996 for the Broadbalk Wilderness.

# **Figure Captions:**

**Figure 1**: Typical air-dry, glycol-solvated and heated XRD traces for the <0.2 um clay fraction of a sub soil taken from the Park Grass Experiment. Sample shown is from the Park Grass Experiment, 1906 Control Plot, 46-69cm.

**Figure 2**: Decomposition of an air-dry XRD trace for the  $<0.2 \mu m$  clay fraction from a Rothamsted top soil sample. Sample shown is from the Park Grass Experiment, 1876, Plot 3, 0-23 cm.

**Figure 3:** Changes in top soil pH (0-23cm) with time in samples taken from the (i) control (•), (ii)  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$  ( $\Box$ ) and (iii) NaNO<sub>3</sub> ( $\blacktriangle$ ) plots from the Park Grass Experiment. The point for 1856 ( $\diamond$ ), is an estimated value for the start of the experiment taken from Johnston *et al.* (1986).

**Figure 4:** Changes in (a) exchangeable K, (b) exchangeable Ca, (c) exchangeable Mg and (d) exchangeable Na in top soil (< 2 mm) taken from the unlimed (i) control (ii)  $(NH_4)_2SO_4$  and (iii) NaNO<sub>3</sub> plots of the Park Grass Experiment.

**Figure 5:** Changes in d(001) spacing with time in (a) high smectite *I/S*, (b) low smectite *I/S* and (c) 'illite' phases identified using peak decomposition for XRD traces from Park Grass (i) control (•), (ii) (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> ( $\Box$ ) and (iii) NaNO<sub>3</sub> ( $\blacktriangle$ ) plots analysed from the Park Grass Experiment (0-23 cm).

**Figure 6:** Sub soil (a) pH, (b) exchangeable K, (c) exchangeable Ca, (d) exchangeable Mg and (e) exchangeable Na in top soil (<2 mm) samples taken from the (i) control (ii) (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and (iii) NaNO<sub>3</sub> plots of the Park Grass Experiment in 2002.

**Figure 7:** Changes in d(001) spacing with time in (a) high smectite *I/S*, (ii) low smectite *I/S* and (iii) 'illite' phases identified using peak decomposition for XRD traces from Park Grass (i) control (•), (ii) (NH<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> ( $\Box$ ) and (iii) NaNO<sub>3</sub> ( $\blacktriangle$ ) plots analysed from the Park Grass Experiment (46-69 cm).

**Figure 8:** Changes in top soil pH with time in Broadbalk (□) and Geescroft Wildernesses (●).

**Figure 9:** Changes in *d001* spacing with time in (i) high smectite *I/S*, (ii) low smectite *I/S* and (iii) 'illite' phases identified using XRD peak decomposition from Broadbalk and Geescroft Wildernesses.



Fig 1:







Fig 3:

Fig 4:













**Fig 7:** 



**Fig 8:** 



Fig 9: