## Rothamsted Repository Download

## A - Papers appearing in refereed journals

> Poulton, P. R., Johnston, A. E. and White, R. P. 2022. Response of three cereal crops in continuous arable or ley-arable rotations to fertiliser nitrogen and soil nitrogen at Rothamsted's Woburn Ley-arable experiment. Soil Use and Management.
> https://doi.org/10.1111/sum. 12872

The publisher's version can be accessed at:

- https://doi.org/10.1111/sum. 12872

The output can be accessed at:
https://repository.rothamsted.ac.uk/item/98885/response-of-three-cereal-crops-in-continuous-arable-or-ley-arable-rotations-to-fertiliser-nitrogen-and-soil-nitrogen-at-rothamsted-s-woburn-ley-arable-experiment.
© 26 December 2022, Please contact library@rothamsted.ac.uk for copyright queries.

Table 1 Treatment crops and test crops $^{\text {a }}$, 1973-1997, Block III ${ }^{\text {b }}$, Woburn Ley-arable experiment.

| Year | Continuous rotations |  |  |  | Alternating rotatic |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Arable |  | Ley-arable |  | 1st cycle |  |
|  | $\mathrm{AB}^{\text {c }}$ | $\mathrm{AF}^{\text {d }}$ | Ln3 ${ }^{\text {e }}$ | Lc3 ${ }^{\text {f }}$ | Ln $8^{\text {i }}$ | Lc8 ${ }^{\text {j }}$ |
| 1973 | P | P | Ln1 | Lc1 | Ln1 | Lc1 |
| 1974 | B | B | Ln2 | Lc2 | Ln2 | Lc2 |
| 1975 | H | B | Ln3 | Lc3 | Ln3 | Lc3 |
| 1976 | W | W | W | W | Ln4 | Lc4 |
| 1977 | B | B | B | B | Ln5 | Lc5 |
| 1978 | B | F | Ln1 | Lc1 | Ln6 | Lc6 |
| 1979 | B | F | Ln2 | Lc2 | Ln7 | Lc7 |
| 1980 | O | O | Ln3 | Lc3 | Ln8 | Lc8 |
| 1981 | W | W | W | W | W | W |
| 1982 | B | B | B | B | B | B |
| 1983 | B | F | Ln1 | Lc1 | Ln1 | Lc1 |
| 1984 | B | F | Ln2 | Lc2 | Ln2 | Lc2 |
| 1985 | BE | BE | Ln3 | Lc3 | Ln3 | Lc3 |
| 1986 | W | W | W | W | Ln4 | Lc4 |
| 1987 | B | B | B | B | Ln5 | Lc5 |
| 1988 | B | F | Ln1 | Lc1 | Ln6 | Lc6 |
| 1989 | B | F | Ln2 | Lc2 | Ln7 | Lc7 |
| 1990 | BE | BE | Ln3 | Lc3 | Ln8 | Lc8 |
| 1991 | W | W | W | W | W | W |
| 1992 | R | R | R | R | R | R |
| 1993 | B | F | Ln1 | Lc1 | Ln1 | Lc1 |
| 1994 | B | F | Ln2 | Lc2 | Ln2 | Lc2 |
| 1995 | BE | BE | Ln3 | Lc3 | Ln3 | Lc3 |
| 1996 | W | W | W | W | Ln4 | Lc4 |
| 1997 | R | R | R | R | Ln5 | Lc5 |

P, potatoes: H, 1-yr hay: F, fallow: O, winter oats: BE, winter beans: W, winter wheat: B, spring barley: R, wints Ln1-Ln8, first, second, third year etc. of a grass+N ley: Lc1-Lc8, first, second, third year etc. of a grass+clover 1

Each of the eight rotations ( $\mathrm{AB}, \mathrm{AF}$ etc.) were grown on pairs of plots in each of five blocks. One plot in each pair received FYM; $38 \mathrm{t} \mathrm{ha}{ }^{-1}$ applied every fifth year until the mid-1960s. The last applications of FYM were to Blocks IV, II, I, III and V in 1963, 1964, 1965, 1966 and 1967 respectively.
${ }^{a}$ Test crops are highlighted. Plots were divided to test four rates of N when test crops were grown. The rates of N rotated so that, over time, the C inputs on the four subplots were similar.
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Treatment cropping started in 1938 on Block III, and in 1939, 1940, 1941, 1942 on Blocks V, IV, II and I respectively.
${ }^{\mathrm{c}}$ AB treatment crops: potatoes, cereal, 1-year hay from 1938-75; barley, barley, beans (or oats) from 1978-95.
${ }^{d}$ AF treatment crops: potatoes, cereal, root crop from 1938-75; fallow, fallow, beans from 1978-95.
${ }^{\mathrm{e}}$ Ln3 treatment crop: 3-year grazed grass+clover leys with N from 1938-70; 3-year grass leys with N since 197.
${ }^{\mathrm{f}}$ Lc3 treatment crop: 3-year lucerne or sainfoin leys from 1938-70; 3-year grass+clover leys since 1973.
${ }^{g}$ On four pairs of plots treatment crops alternated between arable and ley rotations.
${ }^{\text {h }}$ The alternating rotations were replaced by 8 -year grass leys with N or 8 -year grass+clover leys. The 1 st cycle of these longer leys started in 1973 on Block III and in 1974, 1975, 1976, 1977 on Blocks V, IV, II and I respectively. The 2nd cycle of 8-yr leys started in 1978 on Block III and in 1979, 1980, 1981, 1982 on Blocks V, IV, II and I respectively. The delay in starting the 2nd cycle of 8 -year leys meant that the effects of all of the different treatment rotations on the yield of the following test crops could be measured every five years.
${ }^{i}$ Ln8 treatment crop: alternating treatment crops from 1938-70; 8-year grass leys with N since 1973 (1st cycle).
${ }^{j}$ Lc8 treatment crop: alternating treatment crops from 1938-70; 8-year grass+clover leys since 1973 (1st cycle).
${ }^{\mathrm{k}}$ Ln8 treatment crop: alternating treatment crops from 1938-75; 8-year grass leys with N since 1978 (2nd cycle)
${ }^{1}$ Lc8 treatment crop: alternating treatment crops from 1938-75; 8-year grass+clover leys since 1978 (2nd cycle).

| nns $^{\text {g then }}$ 8-year leys |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| 2nd cycle |  |
| Ln8 | Lc8 ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |
| P | P |
| B | B |
| H | B |
| W | W |
| B | B |
| Ln1 | Lc1 |
| Ln2 | Lc2 |
| Ln3 | Lc3 |
| Ln4 | Lc4 |
| Ln5 | Lc5 |
| Ln6 | Lc6 |
| Ln7 | Lc7 |
| Ln8 | Lc8 |
| W | W |
| B | B |
| Ln1 | Lc1 |
| Ln2 | Lc2 |
| Ln3 | Lc3 |
| Ln4 | Lc4 |
| Ln5 | Lc5 |
| Ln6 | Lc6 |
| Ln7 | Lc7 |
| Ln8 | Lc8 |
| W | W |
| R | R |
|  |  |
|  |  |

er rye.
ley.
3.

Table 2 Effect of preceeding cropping on the grain yield, grain N content and \% recovery of fertiliser N by the grain of tl 1 st and 2nd test crops, Woburn Ley-arable experiment.

| Rotation ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | Grain yield, $\mathrm{tha}{ }^{-1}$ at $85 \%$ dry matter |  |  |  | Grain N content, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1st test crop, winter wheat, 20 yr average, 1981-2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | N applied ${ }^{\text {a }}$, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ |  |  |  |  |
|  | 0 | 70 | 140 | 210 | 0 | 70 | 140 | 210 |
| AB | 2.81 | 5.83 | 6.73 | 7.06 | 40 | 85 | 118 | 138 |
| AF | 2.60 | 6.20 | 7.45 | 7.89 | 38 | 89 | 125 | 150 |
| Ln3 | 3.78 | 6.55 | 7.43 | 7.62 | 56 | 101 | 134 | 149 |
| Ln8 | 4.24 | 6.81 | 7.54 | 7.39 | 61 | 106 | 136 | 144 |
| Lc3 | 5.26 | 7.55 | 8.02 | 7.88 | 78 | 123 | 149 | 158 |
| Lc8 | 5.18 | 7.47 | 7.77 | 7.76 | 78 | 125 | 145 | 155 |
| Within Rotation | F-ratio(595) $=13.87, p<0.001$ |  |  |  | F-ratio(595) $=24.79, p<0.001$ |  |  |  |
| SED | 0.226 |  |  |  | 3.65 |  |  |  |
| Rotation * N | F-ratio ${ }_{(15684)}=11.05, p<0.001$ |  |  |  | F-ratio ${ }_{(15684)}=4.95, p<0.001$ |  |  |  |
| SED | 0.283 |  |  |  | 4.92 |  |  |  |


|  | 2nd test crop, spring barley, 9 yr average, 1982-1991 ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | N applied, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ |  |  |  |  |
|  | 0 | 60 | 120 | 180 | 0 | 60 | 120 | 180 |
| AB | 2.29 | 4.56 | 5.41 | 5.14 | 32 | 64 | 87 | 91 |
| AF | 1.87 | 4.61 | 5.51 | 5.56 | 28 | 64 | 85 | 97 |
| Ln3 | 4.15 | 5.69 | 5.93 | 5.59 | 57 | 85 | 100 | 102 |
| Ln8 | 4.45 | 5.70 | 5.82 | 5.43 | 62 | 87 | 98 | 101 |
| Lc3 | 4.16 | 5.64 | 5.85 | 5.39 | 60 | 87 | 101 | 99 |
| Le8 | 4.61 | 5.98 | 5.92 | 5.69 | 65 | 93 | 102 | 105 |
| Within Rotation | F-ratio(5 40) $=24.63, p<0.001$ |  |  |  | F-ratio (5 40) $=28.90, p<0.001$ |  |  |  |
| SED | 0.149 |  |  |  | 2.73 |  |  |  |
| Rotation * N | F-ratio ${ }_{(15288)}=12.22, p<0.001$ |  |  |  | F-ratio ${ }_{(15288)}=4.24, p<0.001$ |  |  |  |
| SED | 0.232 |  |  |  | 4.45 |  |  |  |

2nd test crop, winter rye, 5 yr average, 1997-2001

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | N applied, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ |  |  |  |  |
|  | 0 | 40 | 80 | 120 | 0 | 40 | 80 | 120 |
| AB | 3.19 | 5.00 | 6.44 | 6.92 | 30 | 48 | 67 | 81 |
| AF | 2.48 | 4.44 | 5.55 | 6.32 | 23 | 40 | 54 | 72 |
| Ln3 | 5.05 | 6.61 | 7.42 | 7.14 | 49 | 67 | 83 | 91 |
| Ln8 | 5.35 | 6.91 | 7.56 | 7.64 | 55 | 70 | 87 | 96 |
| Lc3 | 4.97 | 6.43 | 7.21 | 7.12 | 50 | 67 | 82 | 90 |
| Lc8 | 4.98 | 6.77 | 7.16 | 7.12 | 51 | 72 | 85 | 93 |
| Within Rotation | F-ratio(5 20) $=15.47, p<0.001$ |  |  |  | F-ratio ${ }_{(520)}=22.24, p<0.001$ |  |  |  |
| SED | 0.302 |  |  |  | 3.60 |  |  |  |
| Rotation * N | F-ratio $\left.{ }_{(15} 144\right)=1.94, p<0.05$ |  |  |  | F-ratio ${ }_{(15144)}=0.75$, not significant |  |  |  |
| SED | 0.451 |  |  |  | 5.05 |  |  |  |

[^0]he
$\qquad$
——


| Recovery of fertilizer N <br> by grain, $\%$ |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |
| 70 | 140 | 210 |
| 65 | 56 | 47 |
| 73 | 62 | 54 |
| 65 | 56 | 45 |
| 65 | 54 | 40 |
| 65 | 51 | 38 |
| 67 | 48 | 37 |


|  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 60 | 120 | 180 |
|  |  |  |
| 53 | 46 | 33 |
| 60 | 48 | 38 |
| 47 | 36 | 25 |
| 42 | 30 | 22 |
| 45 | 34 | 22 |
| 47 | 31 | 22 |


|  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 40 | 80 | 120 |
|  |  |  |
| 45 | 46 | 43 |
| 43 | 39 | 41 |
| 45 | 43 | 35 |
| 38 | 40 | 34 |
| 43 | 40 | 33 |
| 53 | 43 | 35 |

Table 3 Estimated mean maximum yields, Ymax, and associated mean nitrogen application, Nmax, in the model for winter wheat, spring barley and winter rye, Woburn Ley-arable experiment.

| Rotation | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Winter wheat } \\ 1981-2000 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  | Spring barley$1982-1991^{\mathrm{a}}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Wint } \\ & 1997- \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Ymax, $\mathrm{tha}^{-1}$ | Nmax, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ | Ymax, $\mathrm{tha}^{-1}$ | Nmax, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ | Ymax, $\mathrm{t} \mathrm{ha}{ }^{-1}$ |
| AB mean range | 7.10 (0.427) | 175 (5.9) | 5.34 (0.606) | 140 (7.6) | 7.07 (0.741) |
|  | 2.87-10.32 | 102-217 | 2.10-8.11 | 105-176 | 4.60-9.02 |
| AF mean range | 7.91 (0.316) | 192 (5.0) | 5.76 (0.515) | 150 (6.0) | 6.25 (0.751) |
|  | 4.89-10.94 | 154-224 | 3.68-8.13 | 125-183 | 5.07-8.28 |
| Ln3 mean range | 7.67 (0.308) | 170 (4.8) | 5.99 (0.453) | 113 (6.6) | 7.49 (0.820) |
|  | 5.10-10.21 | 125-205 | 3.96-7.96 | 72-136 | 5.14-9.82 |
| Ln8 mean range | 7.63 (0.266) | 160 (3.8) | 5.85 (0.474) | 102 (5.5) | 7.88 (0.787) |
|  | 5.56-9.97 | 122-185 | 3.62-7.83 | 72-133 | 5.33-9.73 |
| Lc3 mean range | 8.20 (0.281) | 147 (7.9) | 5.84 (0.525) | 107 (5.5) | 7.49 (0.873) |
|  | 6.29-10.62 | 38-189 | 3.42-8.12 | 84-128 | 5.14-9.82 |
| Lc8 mean range | 8.03 (0.288) | 145 (7.7) | 6.10 (0.486) | 104 (4.1) | 7.41 (0.812) |
|  | 6.27-10.27 | 55-193 | 3.79-8.24 | 86-114 | 5.05-10.18 |

[^1]| er rye |
| :--- |
| -2001 |
| Nmax, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ |
| $125(12.1)$ |
| $50-128$ |
| $125(6.3)$ |
| $107-146$ |
| $96(10.5)$ |
| $61-136$ |
| $99(12.0)$ |
| $50-128$ |
| $97(14.9)$ |
| $41-125$ |
| $95(10.3)$ |
| $62-131$ |

Table 4 Vertical and horizontal shifts required to bring the fitted yield response curves for five rotations into coincidence with that for the AB rotation, Woburn Ley-arable experiment.

| Rotation | Winter wheat 1981-2000 |  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Spring barley } \\ 1982-1991^{\text {a }} \end{gathered}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Winter rye } \\ & 1997-2001 \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Vertical shift ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | Horizontal shift ${ }^{\text {c }}$ | Vertical shift ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | Horizontal shift ${ }^{\text {c }}$ | Vertical shift ${ }^{\text {b }}$ | Horizontal shift ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |
| AF | 0.81 (0.102) | -17 (3.0) | 0.42 (0.098) | -10 (3.2) | -0.82 (0.23) | 0 (5.9) |
| Ln3 | 0.57 (0.098) | 5 (3.2) | 0.62 (0.092) | 27 (3.9) | 0.42 (1.70) | 29 (6.5) |
| Ln8 | 0.53 (0.097) | 15 (3.4) | 0.51 (0.090) | 38 (4.3) | 0.81 (1.59) | 26 (6.4) |
| Lc3 | 1.10 (0.096) | 28 (3.8) | 0.50 (0.091) | 33 (4.1) | 0.44 (1.68) | 28 (6.5) |
| Lc8 | 0.93 (0.096) | 30 (3.8) | 0.76 (0.091) | 35 (4.2) | 0.34 (1.79) | 30 (6.6) |

${ }^{a}$ The 1983 data for spring barley was not used in the response curve fitting exercise as an extra $60 \mathrm{kgN} \mathrm{ha}{ }^{-1}$
was applied to all, except the N0, treatments following prolonged heavy rain in April and May.
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Vertical shift is the estimated shift in maximum yield, $\mathrm{tha}{ }^{-1}$, compared to the yield in the AB rotation. A negative value indicates that the fitted yield was lower than that for the $A B$ rotation.
${ }^{\mathrm{c}}$ Horizontal shift is the estimated shift in effective spring applied N fertilizer, $\mathrm{kg} \mathrm{ha}{ }^{-1}$, compared to the AB rotation. A negative value indicates that more N was required to achieve the same yield as that in the AB rotation.
Figures in parentheses are the standard errors of the estimated vertical and horizontal shifts.

Table 5 Regression coefficients for the yield of wheat ${ }^{\text {a }}$ given no fertilizer N versus $\% \mathrm{~N}$ in soil ${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$, Woburn Ley-arable.

| Source | Estimate | S.E. | $\mathrm{t}(154)$ | $P$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | ---: |
| \%N in soil | 38.53 | 5.370 | 7.17 | $<0.001$ |
| Block I | -0.917 | 0.493 | -1.86 | 0.065 |
| Block II | -0.793 | 0.561 | -1.41 | 0.159 |
| Block III | 0.345 | 0.572 | 0.60 | 0.547 |
| Block IV | -0.669 | 0.632 | -1.06 | 0.282 |
| Block V | -0.063 | 0.586 | -0.11 | 0.915 |
| Source | Estimate | S.E. | $\mathrm{t}(152)$ | $P$ |
| Rotation AB | -3.93 | 1.17 | -3.35 | 0.001 |
| Rotation AF | -1.03 | 1.10 | -0.93 | 0.352 |
| Rotation Ln3 | 0.64 | 1.59 | 0.40 | 0.686 |
| Rotation Ln8 | 5.05 | 1.81 | 0.006 |  |
| \%N.Rotation AB | 73.8 | 12.7 | 5.82 | $<0.001$ |
| \%N.Rotation AF | 46.7 | 14.0 | 3.34 | 0.001 |
| \%N.Rotation Ln3 | 27.7 | 13.9 | 16.4 | -0.45 |
| \%N.Rotation Ln8 | -7.3 |  | 0.048 |  |

[^2]$\qquad$
ns
ns
ns
ns
ns
ns
ns


[^0]:    ${ }^{\text {a }}$ In 1981 wheat received $0,63,126,189 \mathrm{kgN} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$
    ${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ For rotation cropping see text
    ${ }^{\text {c }}$ Excludes 1983 as extra N was applied to all except N0 plots

[^1]:    ${ }^{\text {a }}$ The 1983 data for spring barley was not used in the response curve fitting exercise as an extra $60 \mathrm{kgN} \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ was applied to all, except the N0, treatments following prolonged heavy rain in April and May.
    Figures in parentheses are standard errors for Ymax and Nmax derived from the estimated values for each year.

[^2]:    ${ }^{\text {a }}$ Yield of winter wheat grain, tha at $85 \%$ dry matter, 1981-2000. Grown on each of the five blocks in four of the 20 years.
    ${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Soil sampled prior to ploughing and drilling winter wheat.

